Federated Search Falls Short

Stacey Knight-Davis, Eastern Illinois University
Sarah L. Johnson, Eastern Illinois University
Karen Whisler, Eastern Illinois University
Federated Search Falls Short

Stacey Knight-Davis
Karen Whisler
Sarah Johnson
Booth Library, Eastern Illinois University

- 12,000 total students
- 10,600 FTE
- Master’s Comprehensive
- Centralized Library
Federated Searching

- Offers one interface to search multiple databases simultaneously.
- Acts as a portal only—no indexing
- Basic search commands sent through a *connector* to multiple databases
- Z39.50, Search/Retrieve via web
WebFeat Implementation

- Provided by CARLI
- Launched October 2005
- Search box embedded in existing pages
General Article Indexes

Magazines and Journal Articles

General Article Indexes

Resources By Subject

Vendor

Booth Library Periodicals List - an alphabetical list of periodicals and indexes accessible to Booth Library users. The list includes call number and holdings information for each title.

Databases - All Subjects

19th Century UK Periodicals Digital Archive: New Readerships Collection

The New Readerships: Women’s, Children’s Humor and Leisure/Sport Collection offers access to a wide variety of British life in the 19th century, including women’s issues, social issues, and Victorian life and culture.

Abstracts in Social Gerontology

Covers essential areas related to social gerontology, including the psychology of aging, elder abuse, society and the areas of relevance to the discipline. The index contains 70,000 records, which are carefully selected from the most relevant and recent literature (1990 to present).

ACS Publications
General Article Indexes

Search all the below databases. (Except marked by X)

- **InfoTrac Expanded Academic Index ASAP**
  - Abstracts and many complete articles from scholarly and general-interest journals in the social sciences, humanities and nontechnical sciences. (1930 to present)

- **EBSCO Academic Search Premier**
  - Indexes over 8,000 periodicals, providing full text for over 4,500 titles covering the social sciences, humanities, general science, multi-cultural studies, education, and much more.

- **Lexis-Nexis**
  - Full text access to a wide range of newspapers, business, legal, medical and political information, both foreign and domestic. Includes New York Times. (1980 to present)

- **JSTOR**
  - Digital archive of over 650 core academic journals. A complete archive of titles digitized starting with the very first issue of the journal. Browse Titles

- **Article1st**
  - Citations and many complete articles from 12,000 journals in all subjects. (Generally, 1990 to present)

- **WilsonSelectPlus**
  - Citations, abstracts and complete articles from almost 1400 periodicals covering subjects in the general sciences, humanities, current events and business (Generally, 1994 to present, updated weekly).

- **Issues and Controversies On File**
  - This database combines analysis and explanations of opposing points of view for current and historical events. It includes chronologies, illustrations, maps, tables, sidebars, bibliographies and contact information.
Literature/Drama

Subject Specific Databases

Columbia Granger’s World of Poetry
There are over 181,000 fulltext poems with biographies, commentaries, critical context, and a glossary in this database.

Humanities International Complete
A collection of references to literary, scholarly and creative journals in the humanities, published worldwide. This database covers over 1,900 journals dating as far back as 1925, including full text for more than 770 journals.

JSTOR
Digital archive of over 1,000 core academic journals. A complete archive of titles digitized starting with the very first issue of the journal. Browse Titles

MLA International Bibliography (EBSCO)
MLA International Bibliography is a bibliography of journal articles, books and dissertations. Produced by the Modern Language Association, the electronic version of the bibliography dates back to 1926 and contains over 1.7 million citations from more than 4,400 journals and books from over 1,000 publishers.

Project Muse
Over 400 fulltext journal titles the fields of literature and criticism, history, the visual and performing arts, cultural studies, education, political science, gender studies, economics, and many others, generally 1995 to present.

Search all the above databases. (Except marked by X)

Related and Interdisciplinary Databases
You searched: Keyword = "libraries"

You searched for "libraries" in the following databases:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hits</th>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>LexisNexis® Academic - Quick News Search</td>
<td>Wilson Select Plus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5373</td>
<td>ArticleFirst</td>
<td>Law Reviews is part of LexisNexis Academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32592</td>
<td>Wilson Select Plus</td>
<td>LexisNexis® Academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>LexisNexis® Academic - Law Reviews</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>LexisNexis® Academic - News Search</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>199042</td>
<td>JSTOR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>518622</td>
<td>Academic Search Premier</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29935</td>
<td>Infotrac Expanded Academic ASAP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results display mode: Grouped
Evaluation

- Review the literature
  - *Federated Search: Solution or Setback for Online Library Services* from Haworth Press (0789036606)

- Check the numbers
  - Periodical Circulation
  - Database Use Statistics
  - Patron Satisfaction Survey
Database use statistics FY05-FY09

Database Retrievals

Database Searches
Annual patron satisfaction survey

- Paired questions:
  - I have used the library’s periodicals collection.
  - I am satisfied with the library’s periodicals collection.
  - I have used the library’s electronic resources.
  - I am satisfied with the library’s electronic resources.
Periodical usage and satisfaction – % of patrons
Electronic resource usage and satisfaction – % of patrons

- FY05
- FY06
- FY07
- FY08
- FY09

- Used Electronic Resources
- Satisfied with Electronic Resources
WebFeat Statistics Module

- Collects searches per database
- Collects “full record” views
Analysis, Fall 2008

- Significantly more full record views in native databases
- Significantly more searches in native databases than WebFeat
# WebFeat vs. Native Databases

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Searches</th>
<th>Full Record or Full Text</th>
<th>Full Record/ Searches</th>
<th>Native minus WebFeat searches</th>
<th>Native %-WebFeat %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Webfeat Academic Search™ Premier</td>
<td>2358</td>
<td>375</td>
<td>15.9%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native</td>
<td>47420</td>
<td>24714</td>
<td>52.1%</td>
<td>54.0%</td>
<td>38.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Webfeat JSTOR</td>
<td>2733</td>
<td>506</td>
<td>18.5%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native</td>
<td>15492</td>
<td>4083</td>
<td>26.4%</td>
<td>28.0%</td>
<td>9.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Webfeat Expanded Academic ASAP</td>
<td>2171</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>5.0%</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native</td>
<td>7845</td>
<td>4553</td>
<td>58.0%</td>
<td>78.3%</td>
<td>73.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Things to consider…

- Differing expectations
- Database-dependent search techniques
- Staffing issues
- Statistics tracking
- Pre-testing of potential purchases
Expectations vs. Reality

Librarians: 
resource discovery

Students/Patrons: 
finding full text, fast
   Author: Patti Capol Swarz
   Pub.: 2003-06
   Volume: 20
   Issue: 1-2
   Pages: 207(3)
   Description: 1227 words; Book Review
   View: 3 PDF Pages

Results 1 to 10 of 19

1. Add 16 Acres to Ida Wells Home Plan
   Author: THOMAS BUCK
   Journal: Chicago Daily Tribune (Chicago, Ill.)
   Pub.: 1950-10-01
   Pages: S1 (2 pages)
   View

2. Ida Wells Woman's Club Will Hear Author Today
   Journal: Chicago Daily Tribune (Chicago, Ill.)
   Pub.: 1950-02-09
   Pages: S_A2 (1 pages)
   View

3. FAMILIES MOVE INTO IDA WELLS PROJECT TODAY
   Journal: Chicago Daily Tribune (Chicago, Ill.)
   View
Database-dependent search techniques

- relevancy
- dates
- sorting
- Full Text View
- duplication
- author / title / subject
- keywords
- timeouts
How databases interpret keyword search for “bird flu” in WebFeat
How databases interpret keyword search for “bird flu” in WebFeat

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hits</th>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>516</td>
<td>ArticleFirst</td>
<td>Law Reviews is part of LexisNexis Academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1202</td>
<td>JSTOR</td>
<td>LexisNexis® Academic - News Search</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>146</td>
<td>LexisNexis® Academic - Law Reviews</td>
<td>Law Reviews is part of LexisNexis Academic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>LexisNexis® Academic - News Search</td>
<td>LexisNexis® Academic - News Search</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>418</td>
<td>Infotrac Expanded Academic ASAP</td>
<td>Wilson Select Plus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1839</td>
<td>LexisNexis® Academic - Quick News Search</td>
<td>Wilson Select Plus</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5638</td>
<td>Academic Search Premier</td>
<td>Online Catalog</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>146</td>
<td>Wilson Select Plus</td>
<td>Online Catalog</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Online Catalog</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>I-Share</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ArticleFirst** = Boolean AND  
**JSTOR** = Boolean OR  
**LexisNexis** = Boolean AND, or phrase (could not duplicate)  
**InfoTrac** = Boolean AND (academic journals category)  
**Academic Search Premier** = Boolean AND + synonyms  
**Voyager Online Catalog and I-Share** = Boolean AND
How databases interpret full-text searches in WebFeat
Compare to the native interfaces…
Compare to the native interfaces…
You searched: Keyword = "ida wells"

Keyword ▼ ida wells
And ▼ Keyword ▼
And ▼ Keyword ▼

Full-text articles only

Search Clear All

Complete!

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hits</th>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Humanities International Complete</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>America: History and Life</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Academic Search Premier</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>MLA International Bibliography</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>African American Newspapers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5431</td>
<td>JSTOR</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>Infotrac Expanded Academic ASAP</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Social Science Abstracts</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Chicago Tribune Historical Archive</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>American Periodical Series Online (1791-1)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81</td>
<td>Online Catalog</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>281</td>
<td>I-Share</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Choose Databases

To search within a single database, click the database name listed below. To select more than one database to search, check the boxes next to the databases and click Continue.

Continue

Select / deselect all

The Music Index Online

The Music Index Online, produced by Harmonie Park Press, is the single most comprehensive subject-author guide to music periodical literature. The Music Index Online has been available in print since 1949. In 2008, The Music Index Online coverage will span from 1973 to the present and contains surveyed data from over 850 music periodicals from over 40 countries. This database duly cites book reviews, obituaries, news periodicals, and news and articles about music, musicians, and the music industry.

More Information

Academic Search Premier

This multi-disciplinary database provides full text for more than 4,650 journals, including full text for more than 3,900 peer-reviewed titles. PDF backfiles to 1975 or further are available for well over one hundred journals, and searchable cited references are provided for more than 1,000 titles.

Title List  More Information

Humanities International Complete

Humanities International Complete provides full text of hundreds of journals, books and other published sources from around the world. Produced by Whitston Publishing (an imprint of EBSCO Publishing), this database includes all data from Humanities International Index (more than 2,100 journals and 2.47 million records) plus unique full text content, much of which is not found in other databases. The database includes full text for more than 890 journals.

Title List  More Information

RILM Abstracts of Music Literature

RILM is a comprehensive music bibliography featuring citations, abstracts, and indexes. There are currently over 540,000 records in RILM on traditional music, popular music, and classical music, representing disciplines that include musicology, ethnomusicology, pedagogy, psychology, anthropology, sociology and others. All document types and media such as books, conference proceedings (going back to 1835), journal articles, dissertations as well as internet resources, sound recordings and motion pictures are included. RILM also features bilingual abstracts and all non-Roman scripts.
Address staffing issues:

- Integration into library website
- Building search boxes
- Additional programming / configuration
- Creation of subcategories
- Workflow within the library
- Staff and patron training
- Integration into library instruction
Track relevant statistics:

- Useful statistics module mandatory!
  - Are users finding what they need?
  - What percentage click on the full record?
  - What percentage view subsequent sets of records?
  - What is the average response time?
### Database activity, July-Sep 2008

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Searches</th>
<th>Full Record</th>
<th>Next Set</th>
<th>% Full Record</th>
<th>% Next Set</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>JSTOR</td>
<td>2733</td>
<td>506</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lexis-Nexis - Major Papers</td>
<td>2617</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lexis-Nexis - Magazines</td>
<td>2593</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic Search Premier</td>
<td>2358</td>
<td>375</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PsycINFO</td>
<td>2275</td>
<td>249</td>
<td>315</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lexis-Nexis - Law Reviews</td>
<td>2233</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APA PsycArticles</td>
<td>2230</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>4%</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expanded Academic ASAP</td>
<td>2171</td>
<td>109</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCLC ArticleFirst</td>
<td>2140</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERIC</td>
<td>1103</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PubMed</td>
<td>878</td>
<td>337</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Track relevant statistics:

- Interpret other database usage stats in the context of federated search
  - Is usage for any database being inflated because of federated search system?
  - Perform side-by-side comparisons of usage stats: native interface vs. federated search engine
Test new products thoroughly:

- Set up test environment with vendor
- Organize focus groups with librarians
  - public services
  - technical services
  - systems
- Organize focus groups with students / other library patrons
- Keep expectations reasonable!
- Read articles, reviews, relevant blogs; attend webcasts
Suggested resources:
