Designing Professional Development For Better Pedagogy

* a higher education experience in Pakistan
Designing Professional Development for Better Pedagogy
Designing Professional Development for Better Pedagogy

a higher education experience in Pakistan

Authored by Imran Anjum Chaudary ♦ Shahida Imran

CreateSpace, Amazon
Charleston, SC
DEDICATION

With love, we dedicate this book to:

His Holiness Mian Muhammad Qalb-E-Saleem Sahib
Sahibzada Mian Muhammad Umair, Sahibzada Mian Muhammad Zunair

Chaudary Khushi Muhammad (Chacha Ji) and Sairan Khushi (Ammi)
Muhammad Bilal (Lala Ji) and Surriah Bilal

Muneera Bashir (Nano) and Chaudary Muhammad Bashir (Nana Abbu)

Aroma, Viola, Sarmad, Sahaab and Hussain
# CONTENTS

Preface xi  
Organization of Text xi  
Acknowledgements xii  
About the Authors xiii  

1. Chapter One: Context, issue and purpose 1  
   Conceptual framework 5  
   Purpose and objectives of the study 7  
   Research question and methodology 8  

2. Chapter Two: Review of the literature 10  
   Professional development: concept, major characteristics and importance 10  
   Knowledge and skills for teachers of adults 14  
   Factors contributing to effective professional development 16  
   A review of professional development models and designs 23  
   Gaps 30  
   Conclusions 30  

3. Chapter Three: Teacher professional development in Pakistan 33  
   The practice and design 33  
   Underlying assumptions 35  

4. Chapter Four: Pretext to methodology and design 40  
   Methodology 40  
   The research rationale 41  
   The ethnographic case study approach 41  
   Method 43  
   Sampling and participant access 45  
   Introduction to the participants 46  
   Type of data analysis 47  
   Rigour and trustworthiness 49  
   Ethical issues and protection of human subjects involved 50
Summary of the study design

5. Chapter Five: Findings and analysis
Challenges, support and professional development access
Professional development needs, relevance, and preferences
Purpose of professional development
Characteristics of effective professional development
Forms of professional development and their relevance
Achievements as a result of professional development
Final comments
Analysis
Conclusion

6. Chapter Six: Discussion
Theme 1: Lack of professional support
Theme 2: Site-based provision of professional development
Theme 3: Social learning as the pedagogy
Theme 4: Generic and discipline-based teaching skill formation
Theme 5: Evaluation
A new model of effective professional development
Explanation: inside-out
Explanation: outside-in
Conclusion

7. Chapter Seven: Conclusion and recommendations
Answering the research question
Limitations of the study
Recommendations
The end of the story

References

Appendices
Appendix A: Plain language statement
Appendix B: Participant consent form
Appendix C: Interview questions
Appendix D: Sample of interview transcript 113
Appendix E: Sample of data reduction 114
Appendix F: Sample of data matrix design 115
Appendix G: Sample of data analysis notes 117
Appendix H: Designing of the Professional Development Model 118
Appendix I: Map of Pakistan and the research sites 119

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1: Spectrum of PD models 26
Table 2.2: Models of professional development 28
Table 3.1: Summary of NAHE project phase I 34
Table 3.2: Analysis of the Pakistani professional development 36
Table 4.1: Introduction to the study participants 46

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 2.1: Quadrants of teacher learning 24
Figure 6.1: A new model of professional development 84
Figure 6.2: The first section of the model: individual and social learning 85
Figure 6.3: The second section of the model: the role of school leadership 85
Figure 6.4: The third section of the model: evaluation 86
PREFACE

The mission of the *Designing Professional Development for Better Pedagogy* is to make a contribution to the understanding of Pakistani professional development in tertiary and higher education sectors. The inspiration for this book came from a research project on teacher development conducted by us in 2009 at the Melbourne Graduate school of Education, the University of Melbourne, Australia. This ethnographic case study, conducted in 2011, not only refreshes the results of our previous research, but also moves the debate forward by analysing the problems and practices of Pakistani professional development, cataloguing the voices of tertiary/higher education teachers, introducing a new vision of professional development, and providing a basic fabric and some structure for the suggested reforms to take place. The book is of particular interests to those who implement professional development programmes for teacher educators-leaders, instructional coaches, staff developers, university and college teachers, researchers and practitioners.

ORGANIZATION OF TEXT

Chapter 1 contains the introduction to the context, the issue, and the purpose of this study. Chapter 2 presents a critical review of literature from the discipline of education and professional development for college/university teachers. Chapter 3 presents the analysis of Pakistani professional development practice and its design. Chapter 4 explains the methodology and the rationale underpinning the research approach, the methods of data collection and analysis, study sample, and the ethical issues. Chapter 5 comprises the findings and the analysis of the study. Chapter 6 contains the discussion of the themes emerged from the analysis of the findings and the categories generated through the review of the literature, and a new model of effective professional development. Chapter 7 consists of the conclusion, some limitations of the study, and recommendations drawn from the study.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Sincere credit is due to many people who contributed to the completion of this work. We believe simple thanks will not be sufficient to acknowledge our gratitude for their valuable gifts of time, support and encouragement. We extend our deep appreciation to: our study participants for their willingness to participate in our study and share their valuable stories and insights; Dr David George Beckett, Dr Dianne Mulcahy, and Dr Pam St. Leger (MGSE, University of Melbourne) for their valuable advice; Khurshid Bilal (Baji) for her care and prayers; Imtiaz Ahmad Chaudary for his continual guidance and friendship; Irfan, Zeeshan, Aqeel, and Shazia for their friendship, presence, and support; and Aroma, Viola, Sarmad, Sahaab and Hussain for making our parenthood a much richer, more wonderful and more delightful experience.

2012
ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Imran Anjum Chaudary is Faculty Member in the School of Education at the Beaconhouse National University, and the Lahore College for Women University, Pakistan. Imran’s on-going research interests include: teacher learning and development, learning communities, teacher beliefs and pedagogies, social-constructivist learning, programme evaluation, ethnography, case study, teacher narratives and biographies. Contact email: imran.ic@gmail.com

Shahida Imran is an independent academic and consultant in educational leadership, curriculum improvement, and innovative instructional strategies. Shahida’s research interests include: principal education, identity and equity, improving workplace performance, and project and research reviews. Contact email: shahidaimran@yahoo.com
CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION: CONTEXT, ISSUE AND PURPOSE

To a music lover watching a concert from the audience, it would be easy to believe that a conductor has one of the easiest jobs in the world. There he stands, waving his arms in time with the music, and the orchestra produces glorious sounds, to all appearances quite spontaneously. Hidden from the audience – especially from the musical novice – are the conductor’s abilities to read and interpret all of the parts at once, to play several instruments and understand the capacities of many more, to organise and coordinate the disparate parts, to motivate and communicate with all of the orchestra (Darling-Hammond & Bransford, 2005, p.1).

The anecdote above partly sets the stage for this chapter. Teaching is a complex, challenging, and constantly changing practice at all levels. On a daily basis, it involves complex decision-making that relies heavily on many different kinds of knowledge and judgement that can directly affect countless minds and lives. It becomes even more intricate when we talk about teaching as a practice at a tertiary or higher education level.
Teachers of adults (college and university teachers) take on a challenging educative process aimed towards a variety of intellectual, professional and economic ends. At a macro level, they prepare a next generation of workers needing knowledge and generic and specific skills necessary to sustain and develop national economies. At a micro level, they facilitate cognitive, emotional, and moral development of adults for their multiple roles as citizens, parents, and community members (Knowles, 1990; Pennington, 2000). To do this successfully, these teachers would need to have a good grasp of the subject matter and be able to present it to adult learners by focusing and contributing to their learning outcomes. Besides, they need to shape their practices, adjust their repertoire of knowledge and skills, and strive to meet the particular requirements of the academic contexts in which the learning takes place (Devlin, 2007). There is a growing consensus around the world today too that teachers are not only one of the variables that need to be improved or changed in order to better education systems, but they are also the most important change agents in these reforms. This dual role of teachers in educational reforms makes the field of teacher professional development (PD) a growing and challenging area, and one that has and should receive major attention across the globe.

Pakistani education sector, however, is troubled with challenges. According to the USAID-UNESCO (2006) report on Pakistan, lack of teacher education policy, absence of linkages among higher institutions, poor quality of teacher educators, absence or poor quality of teacher preparation programmes, symbolic in-service programmes stuffed with fragmented, incoherent, unrelated courses, and lack of any systematic teacher evaluation, are a few serious problems in the sphere of teacher development that have seriously undermined the quality of education and student learning. At present, most of the teacher professional development programmes available to college and university teachers lack in resources, ownership, intellectual rigour, and coherence. Particularly, tertiary and higher education sectors - from grade 13 onwards – are fraught with daunting challenges: absence of accountability and transparency, incongruity of authority and responsibility, inadequate and imbalanced financial system, and an inadequate and unstable system for
supporting the quality of academic programmes, faculty and research (MOE, 2002). Contributing to these problems are the teachers’ passive approaches to their teaching which have little value in a world where creativity and flexibility are at a premium. At the present time, teachers are under-resourced, overburdened, and many of them lack motivation and vision to encompass the emerging challenges; classrooms are largely teacher-centred; teaching methods are often outmoded; rote learning is common; and teaching has become merely copying notes onto the blackboards (World Bank & UNESCO, 2000; MOE, 2002).

The Islamic Republic of Pakistan, a sovereign country of 166.7 million people in South Asia, is bounded by a 1,046 kilometre coastline along the Arabian Sea and the Gulf of Oman in the south, it is bordered by India in the east, Afghanistan in the west and north, Iran in the southwest, and China in the far northeast, while Tajikistan is separated by the narrow Wakhan Corridor in the north. Strategically, Pakistan is situated at the crossroads of the important regions of South Asia, Central Asia and the Middle East (Appendix I).

Historically, Pakistan spreads over much of what was previously the Indus Valley civilization - one of the oldest in the world and dating back at least 5,000 years. In the past, it has received invasions from the Persians, Greeks, Scythians, Arabs, Afghans, Turks, and has afterwards been ruled by the Mughals and the British until its independence in 1947. Since gaining independence, Pakistan’s history has been characterized by periods of military rule, political instability and conflicts with neighbouring India. As we write in 2012, the country continues to face challenges related to ailing economy, bad leadership, corruption, illiteracy, insufficient energy resources, poverty, and terrorism.

According to an estimate (Pakistan Economic Survey, 2009-10), Pakistan has 135 universities (74 public and 61 private universities), 1275 degree colleges, and 3193 technical and vocational institutions. Pakistan also has madrassahs that provide free Islamic education and also offer free boarding and lodging to students. Pakistan’s annual spending on education is 2.1% of GDP. According to the constitution of Pakistan, it is the state’s responsibility to provide free primary education. Around 57.7% of adult Pakistanis are literate - male literacy is 69.3%, while female literacy is 45.2%. Literacy rates also vary regionally, and particularly by sex; for instance, in tribal areas female literacy is 3%. Through various educational reforms, by the year
2015, the ministry of education expects to attain 100% enrolment levels amongst primary school aged children, and a literacy rate of 86% amongst people aged over 10.

Especially, the situation of professional development in the entire tertiary/higher education sectors is problematic: professional development opportunities are woefully inadequate, brief and sporadic (Khan, 1998; Vazir & Wheeler, 2004, Chaudary & Imran, 2012). According to the statistics available, there are 40,194 teachers in Pakistani tertiary and higher education sectors - 20,568 at 1,275 degree colleges (MOE, 2006) and 19,626 at 135 universities (HEC, 2009). These degree colleges, the main higher education providing institutions in Pakistan (MOE, 2002), do not have any professional development opportunities available for their teachers. So these teachers remain ill prepared for their roles as most of them neither have earned any credentials from an authoritative source, such as the government, a higher education institution or a private source, nor have any arrangements for them in place to deepen their knowledge and improve their skills over the course of their careers.

University teachers also share more or less the same situation except that they have a limited access to few in-service courses, namely, the ‘Staff Development Course’ and the ‘Professional Competency Enhancement Programme for Teacher’ (see Chapter 3 for details). These initiatives were taken in 2002 and 2008 respectively by the Higher Education Commission, Pakistan (a central education body which monitors the functioning of all public and private degree awarding institutions in Pakistan). These professional development courses are of the orientation type and have been planned with the idea to reach these teachers at least once to impart generic teaching skills. These efforts, so far, have benefitted merely 9.8% of the total lot in higher education. Discussions with some of the teachers in Pakistan revealed that these courses are drastically under-resourced, politically imposed rather than professionally owned, treated as add on rather than as part of a natural process, and lack intellectual rigour and coherence (Chaudary, 2011).
What are their challenges and their learning needs as teachers of adults? What perspectives do they offer about the current professional development opportunities? What problems do they face in accessing professional development? What are the characteristics of professional development that can suit their learning and development needs? Despite the gravity of the situation and the intensity of these questions, and given that much has been written about professional development, little research has been found that studied experiences and perceptions of Pakistani teachers to understand their learning and development needs.

The aim of this study, therefore, is to investigate the viewpoints of the teachers in tertiary/higher education sector (teachers of adults) to understand and design professional development that is coherent and consistent with their development needs. Knowledge constructed as a result of this study will be a modest contribution to the questions raised above and will inform the profession, the policy, the individuals (teachers and students), the community, and may also add to the thin literature available about the Pakistani context.

Thus, the context of this study is mainly Lahore, Pakistan, and the case participants are six professionals – three teachers of adults, two professional development providers, and one professional development designer who are placed either in degree colleges or universities. The case participants represent a variety of social, cultural, academic and experiential backgrounds but all of them share the same frame of reference, i.e. practitioners in post-compulsory education.

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

Before attempting to approach and understand the phenomenon of professional development and the teachers of adults in Pakistan, it is important to establish an understanding of the concept of professional development. Our framework consists of three concepts:
1) Understanding professional development by its comparison with the old concepts – career development and staff development
2) Understanding teachers as adults and their professional development as adult learning activity
3) Understanding key considerations for analysing the design of professional development

1) Teacher development is the professional growth a teacher gains by achieving increased experience and examining his or her teaching systematically (Glatthorn, 1995, p. 41). To put it another way, professional development comprises formal experiences such as workshops, meetings and mentoring, and informal experiences like reading discipline-specific publications and watching television documentaries (Ganser, 2000). The conception of professional development is, therefore, far broader than career development and even broader than staff development, and is characterised as an on-going, long-term process of sustained growth and development in the profession (Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 2001; Walling & Lewis, 2000).

2) According to Lawler (2003), professional development activities can be worthwhile and useful; they can enhance growth. Or they can be boring, time-consuming, and irrelevant. Lawler argues that professional development practices must view teachers as adult learners and their professional development activity as adult learning. The central ideas of adult learning that can inform this study in understanding professional development are that, as adults, teachers learn:

a) not only by themselves as individuals, but also with others through discussions with their colleagues, friends and family (Cobb & Bowers, 1999);

b) through reflection by considering explicitly or tacitly, their own experiences in applying knowledge to their practice (Lawler, 2003; Schön, 1991, 1996);

c) from self-monitoring i.e. self-assessment and self-correction (Schraw, 1998);
d) from their prior experience in constructing new information and knowledge (Merriam & Caffarella, 2007); and
e) by performing active roles in their learning process (McLaughlin & Zarrow, 2001).

3) Kennedy (2005) argues that the design of professional development can be founded on a few key considerations:

a) the types of knowledge acquisition supported by professional development (PD),
b) the focus of PD – the individual or the collective development
c) the amount of professional autonomy allowed by the PD, and
d) the fundamental purpose of PD – transmission or transformation.

Professional development where the purpose is transmission promotes teacher development through externally delivered expert tuition (Sprinthall, Reiman, & Theis-Sprinthall, 1996), focusing on technical aspects of the job (Kennedy, 2005; Fraser, et al., 2007). Whereas, professional development with transformation as a purpose trusts in professional autonomy, focuses on professional and political contexts, links theory and practice (Sprinthall, Reiman, & Theis-Sprinthall (1996), promotes internalization of concepts, and supports reflection, construction of new knowledge and its application in different situations.

PURPOSE AND OBJECTIVES OF THE STUDY

As discussed above, this study is undertaken with the purpose of designing professional development to improve pedagogic knowledge and skills of teachers of adults in Pakistan. For this purpose, a qualitative case study approach will be employed to approach the actual practitioners – teachers, professional development providers and designers. Their experiences, viewpoints and insights will be crucial in serving the purpose. The objectives of this study are to:
1) facilitate teachers voicing their experiences and to help identify their learning needs;
2) analyse their empirical materials to establish a greater understanding of the context and the practice;
3) shine light on the characteristics of professional development that can fulfil their professional development needs;
4) design professional development that is coherent and consistent with the professional development needs of the teachers of adults.

The knowledge constructed as a result of this study will be of some benefit. Besides its fruits for the teachers of adults and students as main stakeholders, it will inform professional development policy and practice in Pakistan. It will be an exemplar for teachers to voice and share their experiences and histories with others in the construction of new knowledge about their practice. It will contribute to the thin literature that is available about professional development for teachers of adults and Pakistan. It will open new avenues where other practitioners and researchers can walk to contribute further to the field. It will also provide an opportunity to other practitioners and researchers here and abroad to capture a picture of the worlds of Pakistani teachers, their professional practices, their challenges and how they cope with them.

**RESEARCH QUESTION AND METHODOLOGY**

Situated within the background we have outlined above, our research question is:

How are professional development opportunities for Pakistani tertiary/higher education teachers currently experienced, and what changes, if any, should be made?

The question will be answered through a qualitative case study approach, by exploring the viewpoints of the case participants through semi-structured, open-ended, one-on-one interview, and subsequently analysing the data using a Miles and Huberman (1994) -style grid for data analysis.
To inform this study, the next chapter presents the review of particular bodies of literature from the field of education.
CHAPTER TWO

REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

This chapter presents a critical review of literature from the discipline of education with its focus on professional development and teachers of adults. The aim of the review of particular bodies of scholarship is to inform the inquiry by illuminating:

1) an understanding of professional development and its major characteristics
2) the importance of professional development - for teachers as practitioners and for students as ultimate beneficiaries
3) knowledge and skills for teachers of adults
4) factors to consider when designing effective professional development
5) a review of professional development models
6) professional development practices for teachers of adults in Pakistan

PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT: THE CONCEPT AND THE MAJOR CHARACTERISTICS

The conception of professional development is far broader than career development – “the growth that occurs as the teacher moves through the
professional career cycle” (Glatthorn, 1995, p. 41), and even broader than staff development – “the provision of organized in-service programmes based on short-term unrelated courses/workshops, designed to foster the growth of groups of teachers; trapped in government and employer control (Ingvarson, 1998; Glatthorn, 1995, p. 41).

Professional development of teachers, unlike career development or staff development, therefore, is an on-going, long-term process of sustained growth and development in the profession, and is labelled as ‘new image’ of teacher learning, a ‘new model’ of teacher education, a ‘revolution’ in education, and even a ‘new paradigm’ of professional development (Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 2001; Walling & Lewis, 2000). This new perspective of teacher professional development has numerous defining characteristics (cited in Villegas-Reimers, 2003, p. 13):

1) it is based on constructivism rather than a ‘transmission-oriented model’ and assumes teachers as active learners engaged in teaching, assessment, observation and reflection (Darling-Hammond & McLaughlin, 1995; McLaughlin & Zarrow, 2001).

2) it is a reflective and collaborative practice, and helps teachers in constructing theories and practices (Schön, 1991, 1996; King, 2004; Kelly, 2006; Viskovic, 2006).

3) it is a long-term process – a process of culture building and not mere skill training, and allows teachers to relate prior knowledge to new experiences (Cohen, 1990; Dudzinski, Rozmann-Millican, & Shank, 2000; Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 2001).

4) it is purposeful (Guskey, 2002) and is context, practice and reform related (Little, 1999; Nicholls, 2002; Knapp, 2003). It considers teachers’ contexts as communities of practice (Wenger, 1998), communities of learners and inquiry (McLaughlin and Zarrow, 2001), professional communities (King & Newman, 2000), and caring communities (Jenlink & Kinnucan-Welsch, 1999).
5) it incorporates adult learning principles (Piggot-Irvine, 2006; Lawler, 2003) – teachers as adult learners have their own directions, have accumulated experience, and prefer their interests and experiences to guide their learning and problem solving (Merriam & Caffarella, 2007; Mezirow, 1997; Pillay, 1998).

6) it targets professional learning, i.e. transformation of practising teachers’ thinking, knowledge, skills, and approaches to instruction that shape their repertoire (Wilson & Bernet, 1998).

IMPORTANCE OF TEACHER PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

A number of studies discuss professional development and its importance for teachers and students. For instance, studies, like Borko & Putnam (1995), Holland (2005), Darling-Hammond, et al. (2005, p. 391), advocate that the time teachers spend on professional development considerably improves teachers’ practices, provided these programmes are coherent and practice-related. They also contend that professional development programmes, if designed without considering the conception of teaching and learning, would remain feeble change agents for better teacher beliefs and practices.

To shine light on the nature of ‘change’ in teachers’ beliefs and practices, Nelson (1999) refers to the studies of Cobb (1990), Frank, et al. (1997), and Wood & Bennett (2000). Based on these studies, the author illustrates that this ‘change’ is neither simple and straightforward nor so explicit in its nature. It is rather complicated and dialectical – shuttling back and forth between change in belief and change in classroom practice. The studies of Kettle & Sellars (1996), Kallestad & Olweus (1998) and Young (2001) also agree with Nelson in finding how teachers’ professional development affects the way teachers define their goals and how these goals in turn alter teachers’ behaviour in their classrooms. Discussing the practical side of this ‘Change’, Baker & Smith (1999) have identified four characteristics of
professional development that can ensure a sustained change to take place in teachers:

1) concrete, realistic and challenging goals
2) activities that embrace theoretical and practical aspects of instruction
3) collegial support that is collaborative
4) frequent opportunities for teachers to see the effects that their efforts have on students' learning

The literature suggests a strong link between teacher professional development and its positive effects on student learning. There are a number of studies that prove that the more professional development teachers have, the more it results in improved student learning. Studies like National Commission on Teaching and America’s Future (1996 & 1997); Guskey and Sparks (2004, p. 13); Fishman, Marx, Best, & Tal (2003, p. 645); Garet, Porter, Desimore, Birman, & Yoon (2001, p. 993); Supovitz (2001, pp. 81-98); McGinn & Borden (1995); Borko & Putnam (1995); Darling-Hammond (2000), illustrate the logical link that exists between teacher professional development and improved student learning. These studies provide conceptual models to explain the features of this complicated relationship. Borko and Putnam (1995), for example, provide strong evidence which supports the fact that changes in teachers’ teaching methods as a result of professional development result in students’ achievement. Their studies reveal that there is a powerful evidence that teachers’ pedagogical content knowledge and pedagogical content beliefs can be affected by professional development programmes and that such changes are associated with changes in their classroom instruction and student achievement (p. 55).

Darling-Hammond (1998), citing evidence from the report of the National Commission on Teaching and America’s Future, claims that “investments in teachers’ knowledge and skills net greater increases in students’ achievement than other uses of an education dollar” (p. 32).
However, there are numerous studies that indicate the need to undertake more evidence-based research for further illumination of the complicated link between teacher learning and student learning (Guskey and Sparks, 2002, p. 12; Fishman, Marx, Best, & Tal, 2003, p. 643; Reiman, 2004, p. 4). Guskey and Sparks (2002), for example, argue that:

while those responsible for professional development have generally assumed a strong and direct link between professional development for educators and improvements in student learning, few have been able to describe the precise nature of that relationship (p. 12).

In this regard, Sykes (cited in Meiers & Ingvarson, 2005) suggests a ‘gold standard’ for measuring the usefulness of professional development:

[It would be the] evidence that the professional development had positive effects on student learning, presumably through influences on teacher knowledge, beliefs, skills and dispositions, which in turn influenced their instruction. Yet of all the scholarship on this topic, very little meets this standard. We are just beginning a long period of discovery about how to support teacher learning that is in turn productive for student learning (p. 9).

KNOWLEDGE AND SKILLS FOR TEACHERS OF ADULTS

There are wide-ranging studies that have tried to identify what knowledge and skills teachers need to know, and be proficient in, and what professional development programmes or initiatives should promote. Although these studies fail to provide a complete and definitive picture, nevertheless there exists a subtle consensus among them.

The studies of Little (1992), Leithwood (1992), Elmore (2002), and Knapp (2003) have attempted to capture a thumb-nail sketch of the subject. Little (1992), for example, argues that professional development should help
teachers to attain growth in classroom-related knowledge, skills, and judgement and to enable them to contribute to their teaching community. Digging a little deeper, Leithwood (1992) contends that teacher professional development must promote survival skills, general pedagogical skills, instructional flexibility and expertise, leadership and decision-making skills, and finally contribution to the professional growth of colleagues. Elmore (2002) proposes that professional development planning, besides giving thoughts to its broad goals and missions, like, teacher and student learning, should also sketch a list of specific objectives. These could be what new knowledge and skills teachers are going to learn, what process will be adopted, and how this learning will be manifested in their practices as a result of professional development. To Knapp (2003, p. 12), the most immediate goal of professional development is professional learning: “changes in thinking, knowledge, skills and approaches to instruction that form practising teachers’ or administrators’ repertoire”.

Three empirical studies - Marsh (1994), Devlin (2007), and Kember & McNaught (2007) have specifically addressed this subject for tertiary education. Marsh (1994) used students’ evaluation of university teachers to determine what effective teaching is. The results of this study identify nine dimensions of effective teaching which can be grouped in four broad categories: general pedagogical knowledge, subject matter knowledge, motivation, and evaluation of learning. To refresh Marsh’s somewhat dated work, Devlin (2007), using students’ evaluation of university teachers, outlines nine characteristics of effective teaching which are more or less similar to that of Marsh except for two: a repertoire of metaphors to explain content and knowledge, and skills for e-learning.

In contrast to Marsh and Devlin, who based their studies on students’ evaluation of teachers, Kember and McNaught (2007), sought the viewpoints of teachers coming from two different contexts – Australia and Hong Kong – and proposed ten principles of effective teaching, which fall into six broad categories: general pedagogical knowledge, subject-matter knowledge, a repertoire of metaphors to explain content, interpersonal skills, motivation, evaluation of learning, and knowledge and skills to
create and sustain learning environments. Devlin (2007), attempting to capture the whole picture of the knowledge and skills for teachers of adults and which professional development activities should target, claims:

… knowledgeable, enthusiastic teacher who is focused on current and future student learning and who incorporates into his teaching a range of particular skills and practices including, but not limited to, providing clear expectations, explanations and examples, which challenge and engage students in their learning individually and as a group. He or she also provides an aligned curriculum that utilises a variety of appropriate tools and resources and includes assessment tasks that maximise authentic learning and the academic value of the subject, within its various contexts. He or she might also consider the use of e-learning and the inclusion of an element of excitement for students in the learning process (p. 6).

FACTORS CONTRIBUTING TO EFFECTIVE PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

Lawler (2003) and Piggot-Irvine (2006) argue that professional development for teachers of adults must incorporate principles of effective adult learning in its design and implementation. In other words, professional development practices must view teachers as adult learners and their professional development activity as adult learning. Adult learning principles that are commonly found in most studies are: sociocultural learning, reflection, metacognition, prior experience, authentic experiences, and generative learning strategies. I explain each of these now.

Sociocultural learning: As adults, teachers not only learn by themselves as individuals, but also with others through discussions with colleagues, friends and family (Cobb & Bowers, 1999). Through the process of acculturation into an established community of practice, teachers
construct knowledge by conversing with others, analysing problems, identifying solutions, and meeting goals together (Dobrovolny, 2006; Duffy & Cunningham, 1996).

**Reflection:** As adults, teachers are reflective practitioners (Darling-Hammond & McLaughlin, 1995; Lawler, 2003). They learn through careful, deliberate thinking that helps them make sense of experiences and supports their knowledge construction process. During the learning process, reflective practitioners thoughtfully consider, explicitly or tacitly, their own experiences in applying knowledge to their practice (Schön, 1991, 1996).

**Meta cognition:** Adults learn from self-monitoring, i.e. self-assessment and self-correction. It is the process of regulating and modifying our cognitive activity (Von Wright, 1992), planning and selecting strategies, monitoring the progress of learning, correcting errors, and changing strategies when needed (Schraw, 1998).

**Prior experience:** Prior experience is the foundation on which adults construct new information and knowledge (Merriam & Caffarella, 2007; Mezirow, 1991; Pillay, 1998), and these previous experiences act as a baseline against which they compare and contrast new information.

**Authentic experiences:** Authentic experiences are excellent opportunities for adult learners to not only practise new knowledge and skills but also visualise its application in their real contexts, cultures, and worlds. Authentic learning promotes ownership, appropriateness, and motivation among adult learners (Clark, 1996; Savery & Duffy, 1996).

**Generative learning strategies:** Both constructivism and generative learning theory emphasise the active roles adult learners play in their learning process (McLaughlin & Zarrow, 2001). Generative learning strategies involve problem solving, investigating, and researching, and creating solutions to authentic problems. Generative learning requires that learners become investigators, seekers, and problem solvers and that an educator
becomes facilitator and guide on the side (Kiely, Sandmann & Truluck, 2004; Fosnot, 1996; Duffy & Cunningham, 1996).

Lawler (2003) argues that professional development activities for teachers of adults can be valuable and helpful, and can augment growth when they create a climate of respect, encourage active participation, build on experience, employ collaborative inquiry, learn for action, and empower the participants. If otherwise, they will remain boring, time-consuming, and unrelated. Hawley & Valli (1999), on the basis of extensive meta-analysis of research into effective teacher professional development, suggest a set of key markers that influence effective professional development. These include:

1. Goals and student performance,
2. Teacher involvement,
3. Site-based,
4. Collaborative problem solving,
5. Continuous and supported,
6. Information rich,
7. Theoretical understandings, and
8. Part of a comprehensive change process.

To the authors, these principles, when put together, can assist in the development of an effective programme which can result in effective professional development. They further argue that professional development which is disconnected from authentic problem solving is unlikely to have any positive influence on teachers’ and students’ learning (Hawley & Valli, 1999).

Refreshing and advancing the work of Hawley & Valli (1999), Piggot-Irvine (2006) places a huge importance on the roles of school leadership in setting up supportive environments for learning and in nurturing an overall culture for development. The author argues that development is phenomenal when the leadership:
has an enormous appetite to reflect, learn and develop themselves, and creates opportunities for others to learn and develop … this learning, however, is not dissipated. The focus is usually linked to clearly established goals that have been collaboratively developed for the school. (Piggot-Irvine, 2004, p. 11)

Further, in a setting where professional development is profoundly embedded in school life and is supported by the leadership, the workplace cultural norm is ‘learning enriched’ and ‘teachers form a disposition toward their own learning in the fabric of daily school work’ (Little, 1999, p. 253). Fullan & Mascall (cited in Piggot-Irvine, 2004) indicate an imminent risk:

If a teacher does not work in a professional learning community where teachers work collaboratively, sharing passion and purpose for their work, then professional development is short-lived (p. 480).

Caldwell (2008, p. 16) conceives a broader role for school leadership - ‘system leadership’. This has the following characteristics:

1. Partnering another school that is facing particular difficulties
2. Choosing to lead a school that is in extremely challenging circumstances
3. Shape the networks of wider relationships across their local communities to provide supportive roles
4. Working as a change agent within the system to improve levels of attainment, or working as one of the new school improvement partners

While discussing the domains of influence of professional learning and development, Bell & Gilbert (1996) and Clarke & Hollingsworth (2002) argue that teachers’ professional learning comprises three inter-connected aspects - personal, social, and occupational:
1. **Personal**  
   Teachers’ beliefs, values and attitudes are important considerations.  
   Interest and motivation need to be addressed.

2. **Social**  
   Relationships between individuals and groups need nurturing.  
   Contexts need to be supportive to allow enactment and risk-taking.

3. **Occupational**  
   Links between theory and practice need to be strong.  
   Intellectual stimulation and professional relevance are required.

The drive for change originates within the *personal aspect* of professional learning which is further supported by the *social aspect*. In fact, personal aspects deal with teachers’ interest, choice, control and ownership of the learning opportunity (Bell & Gilbert, 1996; Dillon, Osborne, Fairbrother, & Kurina, 2000). If it is taken care of properly, teachers as individuals will feel inclined to form communities of their practice and mutually engage in a common enterprise which will reinforce their shared beliefs and contribute to the reconstruction of their personal and professional identities (Lave & Wenger, 1991 in Fraser, Kennedy, Reid, & McKinney, 2007). Such *occupational environments* provide rich opportunities for teachers to enact emerging learning within their own contexts.

Darling-Hammond’s (2000) view of effective professional development also resonates with what has been seen in the previous discussion – the one that exhibits collaborative, active, connected and on-going features. Corresponding to this, Hill, Hawk, & Taylor (2002) and Poskitt (2001) have put forward five factors that contribute to making professional development work. These factors include:

1. engaging in deep rather than shallow learning  
2. learning, observing and networking with peers  
3. sharing best practice, monitoring, reviewing and evaluating outcomes  
4. translating theory into practice  
5. keeping up to date with professional reading
Bush & Glover (2003, p. 17) have defined deep learning as: “deep learning is centred on the creation of personal understanding through reflection - individual and shared which results in the creation of knowledge, which can then be transformed into action”. Adding to this, King and Newmann (2001) argue that there are better chances for teacher learning to happen when practitioners:

1. can concentrate on instruction and student outcomes in the specific contexts in which they teach
2. have continued opportunities to study, to experiment with and to receive helpful feedback on specific innovations
3. have opportunities to collaborate with professional peers, both within and outside their schools, along with access to the expertise of researchers to broaden their reflection, thinking and repertoire.

To materialise and strengthen the elements of effective development programmes, Lambert (2003) provides a guideline for the type of activities that should strengthen the elements described for effective development programmes above. These activities include:

1. surfacing of ideas, assumptions, histories and prior knowledge
2. engaging in inquiry
3. entering into dialogue and reflection
4. reframing actions and plans to account for what we now know and understand.

Adding to the factors critical in the designing of effective professional development, the component of evaluation is widely suggested in the literature for determining the success of development initiatives. According to the World Bank report (ERO, 2000, p. 18), for the success of on-going professional development, it is imperative to operationalize a system of evaluation to establish its effectiveness for teachers, students and the school practices. This system must:

extend the evaluation of teacher education programs beyond informing facilitators and administrators of the modes of
presentation, relevance, adequacy of facilities, and instructors, etc. Evaluation must also investigate whether attitudes and practices of participants have actually changed for the better and whether these changes are manifest in classroom and school practices (ERO, 2000, p. 18).

The purpose of evaluating professional development, according to Tallerico (2005, p. 28), should be to measure teachers’ affective reactions to development experiences, their cognitive learning from those experiences, their application of that learning in interactions with students, and the systematic support that may be needed further from school to ensure teachers’ and students’ growth. The studies of Piggot-Irvine (2006); Guskey (2002); and ERO (2000) also discuss that the key results or effects of a professional development programme should be documented by the participants to determine changes in the thinking, behaviour, and practice of teachers, to ascertain enhanced quality of teaching and learning, and to introduce, if needed, appropriate interventions.

Finally, the work of Daley (2003) affords valuable insights and background to learner-centred approaches in professional development. The author refers to learning orientation, teaching orientation and teachers’ career stages as key factors to be considered in the design of professional development. Daley has built her argument based on the works of Merriam & Caffarella (1999), Pratt (1998), and Dreyfus & Dreyfus (1985) respectively.

Merriam & Caffarella (1999 & 2007) have grouped a variety of learning theories into five topical areas:

1. **Behaviourist:** to produce behavioural changes in desired direction
2. **Cognitive:** to develop capacity and skills to learn better through information processing
3. **Humanist:** to become a self-actualised, autonomous learner
4. **Constructivist:** to construct meaning from experience
5. **Sociocultural:** to learn new roles and behaviours through interaction with and observation of others in a social context.
Each of these orientations views professional development differently and holds different views about its purpose, learning process, power relationships and its manifestation in teacher and student learning.

About Daley’s second component - teaching orientation - Pratt (1998) had, earlier, identified five different perspectives on teaching: transmission, apprenticeship, development, nurturing, and social reform. In each of these perspectives the relative importance of the learner, teacher, content, context, and ideals is different. The third component affecting participants in professional development is career stage: novice, advanced beginner, competent, proficient, and expert (Dreyfus & Dreyfus, 1985). Professional career stages from novice, who tend to rely on relatively contingent learning (Daley, 2003), to expert, who rely more on socio-constructivist strategies, need to be an important consideration in the design of professional development for teachers.

Daley (2003) argues that professional development that has its focus on teachers and that gives proper attention to the learning and teaching orientations and the career stage of teachers can facilitate environments in which teachers can develop the ability to learn from experience, integrate knowledge and think reflectively. The author further argues that for this to happen we need to “move away from a deficit model of development toward one of professional development and growth” (Lawler & King, 2000, p. 6).

**A REVIEW OF PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT MODELS**

Fraser, Kennedy, Reid, & McKinney (2007), explaining the sphere of action in which professional learning takes place, argue that professional learning opportunities comprise two dimensions: formal-informal and planned-incidental (Figure 2.1):
Figure 2.1: Quadrants of teacher learning (Fraser, et al., 2007, p. 161).

1.1 Formal: Opportunities explicitly introduced by agents other than the teachers e.g. taught courses; or
1.2 Informal: Opportunities that are sought and instituted by teachers themselves, e.g. teacher networking.

2.1 Planned: Opportunities formal or informal but are fundamentally pre-arranged e.g. collaborative planning; or
2.2 Incidental: Spontaneous and unpredictable opportunities e.g. teacher exchanges in corridors or over breaks.

Stein, Smith & Silver (1999) discussing the emergence of a new paradigm for teacher professional development, give more emphasis to an inside-
outside model of professional development. This conception of professional development believes in benefiting from both: the job-embedded and outside experts. They outline its features as:

1. Teacher assistance embedded in, or directly related to, the work of teaching
2. Teaching assistance grounded in the content of teaching and learning
3. Development of teacher communities of professional practice
4. Collaboration with experts outside the teaching community
5. Consideration of organisational context

The works of Kennedy (2005) and Tallerico (2005) afford valuable insights and background knowledge relating to the designs of professional development, their underpinning rationale and premises, and their framework of analyses. Kennedy (2005, p. 247), in her fascinating work, organises professional development opportunities into three broad categories, transmissive, transitional, and transformative. These approaches to professional development, as the author argues, can be studied and analysed by understanding their underpinning considerations (Table 2.1):

1. the types of knowledge acquisition supported by professional development,
2. the focus of professional development – the individual or the collective development,
3. the amount of professional autonomy allowed by the professional development, and
4. the fundamental purpose of professional development – transmission or transformation.

The author contends that professional development, where the purpose is transmissive, does not support or ensure any professional autonomy; rather, it supports, to a greater degree externally delivered expert tuition, replication and compliance (Sprinthall, Reiman, & Theis-Sprinthall, 1996).
Table 2.1: Spectrum of professional development models (Kennedy, 2005).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Models of PD</th>
<th>Purpose of Model</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The training model</td>
<td>Transmission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The award-bearing model</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The deficit model</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The cascade model</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The standards-based model</td>
<td>Transitional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The coaching/mentoring model</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The community of practice model</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The action research model</td>
<td>Transformative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The transformative model</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

By contrast, professional development with transformation as a purpose gives special attention to professional and political contexts suggesting strong links between theory and practice (Sprinthall, Reiman, & Theis-Sprinthall, 1996), and promoting internalization of concepts, reflection, construction of new knowledge and its application in different situations. PD designed within the transformative frame claims a huge capacity to support professional autonomy at both individual and profession-wide levels (Table 2.1). Professional development models labelled as ‘transitional’ have the capacity to endorse the underlying agendas compatible with either of these two purposes of professional development.

Tallerico (2005) has mainly discussed site-based professional development designs such as these:
1. Individually guided design is teacher-centred and promotes individual creativity and professional autonomy. For example, reading self-selected materials, journaling about dilemmas about daily teaching, teaching portfolios, and online courses.

2. Collaborative problem solving design is based on the premise that collaborative work ensures worthwhile learning (Roberts & Pruitt, 2003 in Tallerico, 2005). For example, study groups, mentoring, critical friends, and curriculum development committees.

3. Observation and assessment of teaching design relies on collaboration and specifically, classroom observation and reflection. This design follows these steps: pre-observation conversation, classroom observation, and post-observation dialogue.

4. Training design, being information-based, heavily relies on expert instruction and lecturing, and thus limits professional autonomy e.g. one-shot workshops. A typical training session includes: theory, demonstration, practice, feedback, and follow-ups.

5. Action research design promotes professional autonomy by affording an opportunity for practitioners to introduce change in their practices through reflection which may be individual or collective. Identification of an issue, collecting and reflecting on the data, and initiating change in the light of the results are its usual stages.

Tallerico (2005) has put forward three strategies to think through these models in the context of choosing and implementing them. These strategies include: learner alignment, outcome alignment, and double alignment (a blend of the first two strategies). The author argues that the effectiveness of professional development does not depend on which design is to be selected but on the factors, like learning styles, collective participation, use of active learning strategies, coherence, and finally, duration.
Building on Kennedy’s Spectrum of PD Models (2005) and Tallerico’s site-based designs (2005), Tables 2.2, 2.3, and 2.4 map the models of professional development, their salient features and functions, and their underlying purposes.

Table 2.2: Models of professional development (Adapted from Kennedy, 2005; Tallerico, 2005).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PD Models</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Purpose/Function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The Training Model</td>
<td>The skill-based, technocratic view of teaching delivered by an expert (Little, 1994; Kelly &amp; McDiarmid, 2002).</td>
<td>Transmission; No professional autonomy;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Award-bearing Model</td>
<td>Relies on the completion of award-bearing programmes of study (Kennedy, 2005).</td>
<td>Preparing teachers to implement reforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The Deficit Model</td>
<td>Based on a perceived deficit in teacher performance (Kennedy, 2005).</td>
<td>Preparing teachers to implement reforms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The Cascade Model</td>
<td>Involves teachers attending ‘training events’ and then disseminating the information to colleagues (Day, 1999; Griffin, 1999).</td>
<td>Preparing teachers to implement reforms</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2.3: Models of professional development (Adapted from Kennedy, 2005; Tallerico, 2005).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PD Models</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Purpose/Function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5. The Standards-based Model</td>
<td>Based on teaching standards for what teachers should know and be able to do for uniformity (Kennedy, 2005).</td>
<td>Transitional; More professional autonomy;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The Coaching/Mentoring Model</td>
<td>A mentor provides the newcomers with support, guidance, feedback, and shares resources (Robbins, 1999, p.40).</td>
<td>Compatible with the transmissive and transformative but align a faction more with transformative in its characters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2.4: Models of professional development (Adapted from Kennedy, 2005; Tallerico, 2005).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PD Models</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Purpose/Function</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8. The Action Research Model</td>
<td>Allows teachers to observe, reflect, and improve their own practice (McNiff, Lomax &amp; Whitehead, 1996).</td>
<td>Transformative; Increased professional autonomy; Supporting teachers in contributing to and shaping education policy and practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. The Transformative Model</td>
<td>Based on a life experience, the nature of critical reflection and the connection between transformative learning and development (Mezirow, 1997).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GAPS

There remains much to discover in the following areas to fill several gaps in the literature:

1. There is a paucity of scholarly literature addressing the subject of professional development for teachers of adults in Pakistan, and those available lack depth and rigour.
2. Studies about professional development for tertiary teachers are also emerging.
3. We need to know more about the actual knowledge and skills that teachers in tertiary education need to contribute to student learning.
4. Despite the presence of a few key studies in Australian, British and U.S contexts, the relationship between changed teachers’ beliefs and practices and improved student learning might warrant further investigation.

Whilst we cannot address all these ‘gaps’ in our study, we believe, in the Pakistani context, some contribution can be made.

CONCLUSIONS

To prepare for our fieldwork, on the basis of this critical review of literature, we can now claim:

1. Professional development must be an on-going, long-term process of sustained growth, development, and culture building to support teachers, their education, their work, and their growth in the profession (Cochran-Smith & Lytle, 2001; Hawley & Valli, 1999).
2. Professional development opportunities designed by or for teachers must be consistent with their professional needs, their personal and professional interests, the stage of professional development attained at that particular time, and the contexts in which they work (Daley, 2003; Hawley & Valli, 1999; Darling-Hammond, 1998).
3. Professional development must support and continue to develop teachers’ pedagogical understandings (Little, 1992; Leithwood, 1992; Devlin, 2007, Kember and McNaught, 2007).

4. Professional development practices must view teachers as adult learners and their professional development activity as adult learning. Teachers’ learning will be most effective when their professional development focuses on their practical and relevant issues, supports professional autonomy and encourages them to examine their teaching systematically, promotes reflective, collaborative and socio-constructivist learning, and links theory and practice. (Merriam & Caffarella, 2007; Piggot-Irvine, 2006; Lawler, 2003; Darling-Hammond, 2000; Bell & Gilbert, 1999; Darling-Hammond & McLaughlin, 1995; Hawley & Valli, 1999).

5. Professional development has a significant impact on the success and learning of the both, teachers and students. Professional development influences teachers’ knowledge, beliefs, and skills, which further affect the way teachers define their goals. These goals in turn alter teachers’ overall behaviour and instruction in their classrooms and affect their students’ learning. (Baker and Smith, 1999; Nelson, 1999; Darling-Hammond, 1998, Borko and Putnam, 1995).

6. It is important that teachers be encouraged and supported to participate in a variety of professional development opportunities. They must benefit not only from the latest professional readings but also from their peers, both within and outside their places of work. This engagement in a common enterprise will reinforce their shared beliefs and contribute to the reconstruction of their personal and professional identities. In this way, they will be active designers, implementers and participants of professional development within their contexts. (Fraser, Kennedy, Reid, & McKinney, 2007; Kennedy, 2005; Tallerico, 2005; King and Newman, 2001; Stein, Smith & Silver, 1999).
7. There must be an active system of evaluating the effectiveness of professional development to improve the quality of teachers and teaching and to investigate whether these changes are manifest in classroom and school practices (Piggot-Irvine, 2006; Tallerico, 2005, Guskey, 2002, ERO, 2000).

Now we head towards establishing an understanding of the Pakistani professional development design and practice in the next chapter.
CHAPTER THREE

TEACHER PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT IN PAKISTAN

This chapter presents the analysis of Pakistani professional development practice and design that has been conducted in the light of the claims generated through a review of a selective body of literature in the previous chapter (Chapter 2). This analysis helps identify salient features that explain the design characteristics of professional development in Pakistan.

THE PRACTICE AND DESIGN

According to Calderhead & Shorrock (1997) and OECD (1990), the factors behind how teachers are prepared and how their professional development is promoted, can be understood by looking at the varying perceptions which societies, policy-makers, and teacher educators have of teachers. Various governments and authorities in Pakistan despite knowing the importance of teacher professional development and having the basic means for it, have either ignored or mishandled the situation (Hatfield 2006). At present, the ‘Staff Development Course’ (NAHE Phase-I) and the ‘Professional Competency Enhancement Programme for
Teacher’ (NAHE Phase-II) are the two courses planned, designed and delivered by the Pakistani Higher Education Commission (HEC) with a purpose to improve generic teaching skills of university teachers (NAHE, 2011). These courses are conducted annually at a few human resource development centres in some specific universities, and participants, nominated by their respective department heads, usually have to travel

Table 3.1: Summary of the NAHE Project Phase I & II (Adapted from NAHE, 2004).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Staff Development Courses (NAHE Phase I)</th>
<th>Course Contents:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Launched:</strong> 2004</td>
<td>- Educational Psychology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Course duration:</strong> 24 days</td>
<td>- Advanced Teaching Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Offering:</strong> Annual</td>
<td>- Administrative Planning &amp; Communication Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target population:</strong> University Teachers</td>
<td>- Curriculum &amp; Material Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose:</strong> Generic Skills</td>
<td>- Research Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mode of delivery:</strong> Lectures</td>
<td>- Educational Measurement &amp; Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Follow-up:</strong> No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target (achieved):</strong> 3564 teachers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professional Competency Enhancement Programme for Teacher (NAHE Phase II)</th>
<th>Course Contents</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Launched:</strong> 2008</td>
<td>- Teaching as a Profession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Course duration:</strong> 30 days</td>
<td>- Academic Planning &amp; Management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Offering:</strong> Annual</td>
<td>- Curriculum Development, Assessment &amp; Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target population:</strong> University Teachers</td>
<td>- Learners’ Psychology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Purpose:</strong> Generic skills</td>
<td>- Andragogical Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mode of delivery:</strong> Lectures</td>
<td>- Communication Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Follow-up:</strong> No</td>
<td>- Research Methods &amp; Skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target:</strong> 2500 teachers</td>
<td>- Microteaching</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
long distances to access these. The NAHE Phase-I project, ended in 2008, has targeted 9.8% teachers only. Table 3.1 and 3.2 summarise the policy initiatives that HEC has taken since 2004 to date about teacher professional development. These also explain the type and the nature of professional development that is available for teachers in Pakistan.

PAKISTANI PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT: UNDERLYING ASSUMPTIONS

The Pakistani professional development, if seen in the light of the categories generated in the previous chapter (Chapter 2), depicts the nature and the type of professional development design and opportunities available for tertiary/higher education teachers in the sector. The design and the implementation of these programmes reveal the underlying assumptions the policy makers and the administrators have about professional development. Despite the amount of efforts, capital, and good intention, Pakistani professional development has certain flaws that cannot be overlooked or allowed to continue as these limit its ability to achieve the desired goals. In the next few paragraphs, we have discussed these flaws to bring them to light to inform our research. What these flaws are, we turn to this now (Table 3.3).

1. The design in practice, at first, clearly depicts the type of workplace culture widespread in tertiary/higher education sector in Pakistan. The guiding ethos of this culture supports closely structured and carefully controlled environments for teachers to operate, and are bound to be mistrustful of teachers and their unlimited potential for growth and development. This culture of hindrance rather than help has norms that do not see teachers as fully functioning, thinking, feeling, and active individuals or groups. Thereby, the people in this culture, not having faith in their teachers, tend to introduce short-lived staff development designed
Table 3.2: Analysis of the Pakistani professional development

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Pakistani professional development</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Culture norms</td>
<td>Absence of cultures of continuing support and teacher involvement; Information based design, largely unrelated to teachers’ needs and experiences; Technique driven learning rather than focusing on practice in a more holistic sense.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Learner-centred teaching and learning (learning orientation, teaching orientation, career stage).</td>
<td>Behaviouristic, Cognitive, Transmissive, Novice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Sphere of action in which professional learning takes place: formal/informal and planned/incidental</td>
<td>Formal and planned opportunities established by ‘outsiders’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Domains of influence of professional learning: personal, social, and occupational</td>
<td>Overlooks teachers’ beliefs, values and attitudes, Poor in teacher interest and motivation. Ignores socio-constructivist aspects of teacher learning; does not promote supportive contexts. Largely theoretical and lacks any relevance with teachers’ authentic classroom experiences.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Capacity for professional autonomy and transformative practice supported by professional learning</td>
<td>Transmissive, Absence of professional autonomy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

usually off-site with a purpose to remedy the deficit. On the contrary, cultures that celebrate, recognise, and support an ethos of self-development, learning and inquiry, view everyone (administrators, teachers, and students) in the workplace as a learner. This teacher
disposition further nurtured by fiscal, human and intellectual support has better chances of mutual growth and development through collaborative, collegial, reflective, and other experiential means.

2. The programme is largely a deficit oriented design of professional development and relies heavily on the view that training is essential for all teachers regardless of their experience, expertise and specific learning needs. This simplistic view of professional development regards teachers as an individual rather than a collective enterprise and assumes that knowledge sought in one setting can be successfully transferred and used by learners in their respective settings. As a result, instead of providing a learner-centred professional development where people enjoy social, constructivist, developmental, and nurturing experiences, this programme employs behavioural and transmissive approaches to learning and teaching, and assumes all teachers as novice who need contingent learning processes. This approach might work for those who need initiation into their profession as new entrants; conversely, experienced teachers learn through meaningful conversation and reflecting in and on their practice in the light of their new learning (Schön, 1996). Daley, (2003, p. 29) also suggests that policy makers and teacher educators need to introduce models of professional development and growth if they wish any change, and to do so they have to “change the way they think, the way they teach adults, and the way they organise teachers’ professional development programmes”.

3. The programme is based on formal scheduled events set outside the teachers’ professional contexts, and is delivered by ‘experts’ through traditional lectures. The programme’s purpose, content and delivery are not negotiated with teachers, but rather are set by the deliverer who is an outsider and certainly unaware of the ‘in house’ problems of the participants. New knowledge introduced in such trainings fails to demonstrate any connection to participants’ contexts in which they work, classrooms in which they teach, and the problems they encounter each day. Programmes designed on such lines - pre-packaged, one-short experience - are much disconnected from authentic problem solving and are unlikely to have any influence on teachers’ or students’ learning.
Realistically, just one form of professional development and that too imposed rather than owned will fail to produce any results. Conversely, a robust approach to teacher development is needed that allows teachers to fully participate in their learning process stretched across people, resources and settings, and that offers a mix of formal/informal, planned/incidental and inside/outside activities (Beckett and Hager, 2002; Viskovic, 2006). Such professional development is more likely to effect a significant positive change in teachers’ knowledge, skills and disposition.

4. Having its focus on the occupational aspects of teacher development only, the programme assumes that for teachers to improve their professional expertise, it is important to acquire, irrespective of their particular practices, a generic body of knowledge and then apply successfully in their teaching. This programme can be seen as neglecting personal and social aspects of teacher learning which Bell and Gilbert (1996) regard as key requisites for the occupational aspects to function. We should not forget that teachers’ prior roles, experiences, beliefs, values, and interests contribute towards constructing their stances about how they will function individually, socially and within their settings (Kelly, 2006). Therefore, teachers’ expertise is not merely an outcome of acquiring a specific body of knowledge; rather, it is strongly linked with their individual, social, context, and specific practice needs. Any professional development that pays full regard to these needs can help decide teachers’ occupational needs and can easily motivate them to collectively seek them.

5. This traditional view of professional development does not allow even a modest level of professional autonomy to teachers; thus, has the potential to cause dissatisfaction among participants. This ‘blanket approach’ (Fraser et al., 2007) to teacher development disregards the fact that teachers, as they grow up in their profession, are able to see the larger picture of their work and not only understand the type of problems they encounter in their day to day teaching lives, but also have an understanding of how to approach them (Dreyfus and Dreyfus, 1985). Instead of offering any ownership of the programme, teachers in such programmes are rather coerced and commanded, and, as a result, their performance is reduced. On the other hand, when teachers are trusted,
nurtured, and offered a fair amount of professional autonomy in their programme of professional development and growth, they tend to be high-functioning and display greater cognitive outcomes, happiness, and determination.

On this basis, we will outline in the next chapter how we investigated the viewpoints of teachers of adults to understand what is needed in Pakistan to design professional development that is coherent and consistent with their professional learning needs and their contexts.
CHAPTER FOUR

PRETEXT TO METHODOLOGY AND DESIGN

This chapter presents the methodology and the rationale underpinning the research approach that was chosen to accomplish the task. An outline of the methods and the procedures used to collect, manage and analyse the data and the sampling method are discussed. An overview of the steps taken to ensure rigour and trustworthiness in case study analysis is given. Finally, ethical issues are identified and explained.

METHODOLOGY

In brief, a researcher embarks on the world with particular ideas about it, which can become a framework (ontology) that suggests a set of questions of how this framework is known (epistemology). These questions are addressed in specific ways (methodology) which require actual and detailed procedures and techniques for participant selection, data collection, data analysis, and its reporting (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000, p. 18; Creswell, 2003, pp. 4-5; Crotty, 1998; Jones, Torres & Arminio, 2006, p. 38). Our case study subscribes to the constructivist epistemology, which means that knowledge is an emergent feature of (a part of) the world. This
opens up an interpretive, naturalistic approach, utilising, in this emergence, a qualitative case study to guide the fieldwork, and employing open-ended, semi-structured, one-on-one interviews to collect empirical materials. The details now follow.

**THE RESEARCH RATIONALE**

Since limited research has been conducted in the field of teacher professional development in Pakistan and minimal amounts of knowledge is available to inform the inquiry (Khan, 1998, p. 125; Vazir & Wheeler 2004, p. 86; Hatfield 2006), a qualitative approach will enable a modest, interpretive beginning to be made, which, since it is located in the ‘natural’ experiences of Pakistani life, will confer some epistemological authorities on its findings.

Qualitative research derives its strength from its inductive approach which lets the researcher enter ‘the subjective, lived in worlds’ (Funnell, 1996, p.51; Denzin & Lincoln, 2000, p. 3) of the teachers as research participants. As the study progresses, the inductive approach to participants’ experiences unfolds reality upon the researcher, and the viewpoints and insights of the participants (in this instance, of teachers of adults) help shine light on professional development practices in Pakistan (Ritchie, Lewis & Elam, 2003, p. 3; Gall, G., Gall, J., & Borg, 2007). Unlike a deductive researcher who hopes to find data to test a theory, the researcher in qualitative inquiry pieces together the interpretations participants bring to the phenomena, of which they are a part, and generates an explanation for the data as gathered (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000, p. 4; Goetz & LeCompte, 1984, p. 4).

**THE ETHNOGRAPHIC CASE STUDY APPROACH**

The focus of this research on a small number of teachers of adults and the professional development opportunities in Pakistan suggested the use of a case study approach to qualitative inquiry. Given that, qualitative case
Designing Professional Development for Better Pedagogy

A study is a particular type of research that falls within the ambit of interpretive research (Erickson, 1986), what differentiates case study methodology from the rest of the qualitative approaches is its intensive focus on a bounded system, which can be an individual, a specific programme, a process, an institution, or even a relationship and, in this study, it was on the design of a particular practice for a particular context (Stake, 1978, p. 7; Jones, Torres, & Arminio, 2006, p. 53).

Stake (2000, p. 436) has identified three types of case study: *intrinsic case study* – for a deeper understanding of a particular case only; *instrumental case study* – for the examination of a particular case as an instrument to produce insights into an issue which further aids one’s understanding of something else; and *collective case study* – for a better understanding of a particular phenomenon by studying a larger collection of cases.

This study was situated within the concept and type of *instrumental case study* as described by Stake. Thus, *the phenomenon* under investigation was professional development for teachers of adults; *the case* to be studied was professional development opportunities for teachers of adults in Pakistan and their relevance to their professional learning needs; *the focus* of this case was the study of participants’ insights which could facilitate the designing of professional development suitable to their needs in Pakistan; and finally, *the unit of analysis* was college and university teachers, professional development providers and designers who were though placed in different institutions, yet were united with respect to their specific frame of reference i.e. professional development and teachers of adults.

Along with the case study which helped in defining the boundaries of the phenomenon to be investigated, this inquiry was ethnographic, too, as it enabled us to interact with our participants intimately in their settings to seek a better understanding of their contexts, beliefs, motivations, and behaviours (Tedlock, 2000). Creswell (2007, p. 70) supports the view that ethnographic research enables a researcher to get involved in the setting being studied in order to unfold deeper insights and report them in a style uncontaminated by personal bias, political goals, and judgement. By using
an ethnographic research approach, we were able to listen to our participant’s stories about their professional development and to represent their thoughts and experiences, and our observations, accurately. In order to allow the participants to speak for themselves (Creswell, 2007), we presented *their* voices in the form of consolidated narratives and quotes, and summaries and interpretations of their experiences, in *our* voices.

In short, as we claimed above, this research is a qualitative, ethnographic case study, underpinned by an interpretive, naturalistic approach.

**METHOD**

The study began with a critical review of literature in the field of education focusing upon teacher professional development, as the previous chapter showed. The identification of candidate studies for such literature was made by database searches, using relevant key words and searching University of Melbourne Library Catalogue, the SuperSearch gateway, Education Resource Information Centre (ERIC), A+ Education Australian Education Index (AEI), Web of Science, Intute, and Education Research Complete (EBSCO). A number of major research journals relevant to this study were directly explored and searches were made. Further studies were located by examining the reference lists of articles and reports, and by exploring further readings and bibliographies suggested in the relevant books. Studies found this way have been reviewed with the help of the SuperSearch gateway. Moreover, handbooks of teacher education research, conference papers, and also relevant web pages were reviewed meticulously for the related information. For this review, the key words utilised included: teachers, adult education, professional development, learning, knowledge and skills, higher education, tertiary education, design, models.

The conclusions drawn from the critical review of literature, as outlined in Chapter 2, justify the use of semi-structured, open-ended interviews to collect empirical evidence from the research participants. This method facilitates a comprehensive and deep description of the participants’
experiences, viewpoints and feelings, in this instance, of teachers of adults, about the existing professional development practices in Pakistan while exploring the fulfilling of their professional development needs. More importantly, this method values participants, in recognizing their individuality, their personal experiences, and subject matter expertise, while sharing and voicing their feelings and insights. It also allows researchers, to not only focus upon their interview-agenda but also provides them with flexibility to follow particular themes raised by the participants (Scott & Morrison, 2006, p. 133; Connell & Campbell, 2007).

Interview questions (Appendix C) were prepared in the light of the conclusions drawn in Chapter 2, and were ordered in a systematic fashion so as to facilitate and maintain a good flow of conversation. It was planned to allow and encourage participants to express themselves in their indigenous languages – Punjabi or Urdu – so that they could feel more natural and comfortable. An audio-taped recording of the entire period of contact - sixty minutes - with each participant was planned with the belief that it would ensure an accurate record of the interviews; relieve us as researchers of the burden of taking full notes during the interview; enable us to hold good eye contact with the interviewee; conduct the interview more effectively; and remain sensitive to any anomaly that may need to be addressed at once. In case of us not receiving their consent to record (which did not occur), we were prepared to take notes meticulously and validate them with the participants after the interview.

RESEARCHER AS AN INSTRUMENT OF DATA COLLECTION

In this qualitative research, the empirical materials were mediated through us as a primary, human instrument and not through any non-living tool as is in quantitative research (Denzin & Lincoln, 2000: 368; Marshall & Rossman, 2006, p. 72; Merriam, 1988, p. 19). This enabled us to respond to the context more effectively; adapt techniques to suit the circumstances; expand the knowledge base from sensitivity to non-verbal aspects; process data promptly and efficiently; clarify and summarize as the study evolved;
and finally, investigate anomalous responses (Guba and Lincoln, 1981; Merriam, 1988, p. 19; Phelps, Sadoff, Warburton, & Ferrara, 2005, p. 81). Furthermore, we were aware that our own subjective insights, feelings and reactions to the phenomenon would in fact benefit us in the interpretation of the events in the field. However, we preferred to maintain a stance of ‘empathic neutrality’ (Patton, 2002, p. 49) and to eliminate ‘personal entanglement’ (Wolcott, 1985) in order to stay alert and sensitive to what happens in the field and remain disciplined about recording and analysing data.

**SAMPLING AND PARTICIPANT ACCESS**

Given that qualitative research is almost always confined to a small number of participants in small number of geographical, community or organizational locations (Ritchie, Lewis & Elam, 2003, p. 97), this study is based upon the responses of six professionals. This non-probability, purposive sample of information-rich cases (Patton, 2002, p. 46; Newman, 2003, p. 213) included three teachers of adults, two professional development providers and one professional development designer. These participants were found in tertiary education providers in three cities in Pakistan - Lahore, Gujranwala and Islamabad (Appendix I). This sample, although a small one, introduced to the study a nice combination of three different perspectives and thus added rigor, breadth, complexity, richness, and depth (Flick, 1998) to create a fuller and more comprehensive picture (Yin, 1994; Allen, 2004, p. 14) of the case.

A snow-ball technique was used to approach and recruit the participants where one of our colleagues suggested the first potential participant whom we recruited, and then was referred to another. Each of the research participants was furnished with the informed consent form outlining the details of the study which they signed and returned (Appendices A and B). Afterwards, a time and venue to meet for the interview was arranged. In two cases, permission to recruit potential participants was sought through negotiating with the gatekeepers – a vice-chancellor of a University and a chairperson of a department. They were briefed about the study and were
presented with the Plain Language Statement which they retained as a reference. We were then referred to the potential participants whom we found relevant and thus engaged in the study.

Table 4.1: Introduction to the study participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sairan</strong> is Assistant Professor at a degree college in Lahore. She holds a master's degree in Applied Linguistics. She has vast experience of teaching in rural and urban areas of Pakistan over about thirty years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Khushi</strong> is Assistant Professor and a Head of Urdu department at a degree college in Gujranwala. He holds a PhD in Literature and has been teaching graduate and post graduate classes for the last twelve years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bilal</strong> with a PhD in Education, has been working as Lecturer and a teacher educator at a degree college in Lahore since 2004. Before that, he has served as subject specialist in full- and part-time situations for four years in a secondary college.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Surriah</strong> serves as Director of the project for developing human resource for public and private universities, Ministry of Education Pakistan. She holds a master's degree in Education Planning and Management, and has about fifteen years professional experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aroma</strong> has been serving as a Director of Quality Assurance and a teacher educator at a public university in Lahore since 2005. She holds a master's degree in Business Education. She has been a primary school teacher, a principal, and a divisional education officer for nine years.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Viola</strong> is a Lecturer at a private university in Lahore. She holds a master's degree in Sociology and teaches undergraduate classes: social theory, social statistics, and industrial psychology, which she has done since 2003.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Before conducting the interview, a thorough pilot test of the interview questionnaire was carried out on an individual similar to those who were our final respondents in the study. The aim of the pilot was to check its efficiency on a number of grounds: to test how long does it take to complete it; to check that the questions are not ambiguous; to verify that the instructions are clear; and to eliminate any questions that do not yield
usable data. The pilot-test form of the questionnaire included a space for the respondent to make criticisms and recommendations for improving the questionnaire (Gall, G., Gall, J., & Borg, 2007, p. 236). The recommendations made were related to the delivery of the questions which, later on, were given due considerations while conducting the actual interviews. However, the results from the pilot study were not included with the final results of this inquiry.

**TYPE OF DATA ANALYSIS**

Analysis brings order, structure and interpretation to the amassed data to answer the research question (Marshall & Rossman, 2006, p. 154; Crotty, 1998, p. 92). We accomplished the analysis by using Miles and Huberman’s (1994) framework for data analysis. This framework, known as ‘transcendental realism’, consists of three simultaneous flows of activity: data reduction, data display and conclusion drawing (Miles and Huberman, 1994, p. 10). Though it is not necessary within the scope of this study, a further expansive study may be redolent of Corbin and Strauss’s (2008) grounded theory analyses as well. In that case, the emerging conclusion and concepts can be further compared with more empirical indicators and with each other through open, axial and selective coding to reach a theoretical saturation. However, in this current study, the analysis was conducted through the following steps:

1. Before analysing data, pre-data analysis measures were taken: tape-recorded interviews and field notes were transcribed *verbatim*; interview responses were translated into English; the gathered data was edited where needed and was logged according to its type and occurrence (Appendix D).

2. To seek an intimate familiarity, each research participant’s transcript was read by us a number of times.

3. The empirical indicators from the data were compared and contrasted in search of similarities and differences in the meanings made in the
perceptions of the six study participants about the professional development in Pakistan. This prolonged engagement with the data helped generate preliminary categories which acted as baskets (Marshall & Rossman, 2006) into which segments of text were placed (Appendix E).

4. Significant phrases and statements pertaining to the phenomenon being studied were extracted from the segments of the text and were then entered on to a Miles and Huberman (1994) -style grid, to generate new insights and typologies. For the purpose of this study, a semi-structured style grid was used. The semi-structured nature of the style grid allowed us the flexibility to document the key issues and salient points arising from the data that was gathered through semi-structured interviews. This grid design consisted of a matrix with questions across the top and respondents listed along the sides (Appendix F).

5. At this point, the key issues and salient points were carefully examined and inductively coded (coding developed by directly examining the data) by underlining them with differently coloured highlighting pens. Sub-coding was introduced where equal number of participants communicated more than one points. Parallel to this analysis, we kept shuttling back and forth and kept generating reflective notes (insights), i.e. memos which were also included as additional data for analysis (Appendix F).

6. Categories, patterns and themes emerged which through contemplation and analysis brought meaning and coherence to the generated theme categories (Appendix G). This facilitated the drawing of conclusions and concepts.

7. At this stage no further analysis was needed. The emerging results, well-grounded in the data, were then written.

8. The outcomes, highly contestable and worthy of further debate in a critical way, were a true reflection of the voices of the teachers. They
guided the understanding and description of the nature of professional development that is congruent with the teachers’ professional needs in Pakistan.

RIGOUR AND TRUSTWORTHINESS

To ensure rigour and trustworthiness, the following measures were adopted:

1. A purposive sample of six professionals who were salient to the study was selected.
2. Only those participants were engaged in the study who were neither our colleagues nor in any dependant relationship with us.
3. Those who felt obliged were not engaged in the study.
4. Three different perspectives were gained by engaging three different types of respondent – teachers of adults, professional development providers and a professional development designer.
5. Interview questions were piloted and changes incorporated to ensure their efficiency.
6. Participants were free to choose the venues for interview to ensure an open disclosure of information.
7. A relaxed and comfortable atmosphere was ensured so that participants freely and without any interruption give voice to their experiences and viewpoints.
8. Participants were free to communicate in their indigenous languages: Punjabi or Urdu.
9. Participants were informed in detail of the measures adopted to ensure confidentiality and anonymity.
10. Data was transcribed *verbatim* and translated ensuring all possible accuracy.
11. Participants were invited to review their transcripts and their translations prior to further analysis.
12. All the data was kept in a separate, password-protected computer files which were accessible only to us as researchers.
13. A thorough analysis was made certain through the use of flexible and transparent tools of analysis, i.e. Miles and Huberman (1994) -style grid. The analysis and the conclusions drawn as a result were a true reflection of the voices of the teachers.

14. A brief summary of the findings and results were shared with the respondents.

**ETHICAL ISSUES AND PROTECTION OF HUMAN SUBJECTS INVOLVED**

In this inquiry, our presence in the field was not sustained or intensive. It was brief and personal for in-depth interviews. But still ethical issues like informed consent, confidentiality, anonymity, human interaction, and translation and transcription accuracy were involved in the study. To counter and minimise these ethical issues, we adopted the following measures:

**Voluntary Participation:**
All of the research participants in this study were adults and experienced college and university teachers and the data sought from them was not of a sensitive kind but of a professional kind; therefore, no physical, psychological or legal risks attaching to the data collecting process were involved. All the participants signed the informed consent forms (Appendices A and B) that fully informed them of the nature of the research and assured them that they could withdraw at any point in the research process. The individuals were free to accept or decline participation. The participants were not offered any monetary inducements.

**Confidentiality and Anonymity:**
In order to ensure confidentiality, the participants were informed that a) the information sought from them will not be disclosed to any unauthorised party without their consent; b) the interview transcripts will remain in the researchers’ safe custody during the time of research and
afterwards in a separate locker, and will be destroyed five years after study completion.

As regards anonymity, all participants in the study were informed that a) the researchers will be the only persons who will be able to link names with interviews; b) identity of all the institutions and the participants will be disguised and the individuals will be addressed by their pseudonyms in the final report, in the articles or any other publications generated afterwards; c) since the number of research participants is small, it is still possible that someone may be able to identify the participant.

**Risks Associated With Human Interaction:**
To avoid any misunderstandings, conflict of opinions, embarrassment or anger, pre-interview briefings were conducted to inform them again about the purpose of the study; to explain the interview procedures; to inform them in case of participant distress or fatigue, ask for the termination of the interview or taking mid-breaks. During the interviews, we remained sensitive to any signs of uneasiness, resistance, or other indications of emotional or psychological distress and where found promptly addressed them by negotiating them with the participants. During the contact with the participants, we remained respectful to the participants’ culture, beliefs, values, viewpoints, values, and language.

**Disengaging From the Research Field:**
We made a gradual withdrawal rather than a clean break from the field. For member checking, the participants were provided with an opportunity to read the transcript and the translation (where applicable) of their responses, and also edit where necessary. Four of the participants availed this opportunity and made minor editorial changes which were not more than 5% of the transcripts. This provided an opportunity to the participants to review their final contribution and disengage gradually with their participation.
RESEARCH ISSUES

Researcher's Values, Biases, Assumptions, and Interests
In qualitative research, the influence of the researcher's values, biases, assumptions, and interests may have an effect on certain elements like methodology, questions, data interpretation, and analysis of the inquiry. Some, personal factors that influenced us as researchers in this project were:

1. Our own experiences as teachers of adults;
2. Our familiarity with the participants’ culture, their workplaces, and their challenges; and our fluency in Urdu, Punjabi, and English;
3. Our residency of the city where mainly the research took place (Lahore).

Throughout this research study, these factors were addressed by maintaining our position as researchers and not as inside professionals, by keeping a stance of empathic neutrality (Patton, 2002, p. 49) and by using a robust methodology, and protocols in collecting and analysing the data (as explained earlier in this chapter), and in presenting the findings of the inquiry (in the next chapter).

Generalisability
As this study is limited to a specific case, and the participants’ selection within the context was made on the basis of their relevance to the study and not of their representativeness, the results of this study can be naturalistically and not statistically generalizable (Newman, 2003, p. 211; Flick, 1998, p. 41; Stake, 1995, p. 85). This means, conclusions arrived at through personal engagement in life’s affairs, in this instance professional development, are so well constructed that the persons feel as if it happened to themselves (Stake, 1995, p. 85).
SUMMARY OF THE STUDY DESIGN

This chapter has discussed the rationale for the methodological approach taken in the selection of a qualitative case study, the method of data collection, sampling and participant access, type of data analysis, the elements of rigour and trustworthiness, and finally, the ethical issues and how they were addressed.
CHAPTER FIVE

FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

This chapter comprises the findings and the analysis of the study. The data was collected from six interview participants in light of the research design discussed in the previous chapter. The interview participants were three teachers of adults, two professional development providers and one professional development designer placed in six different degree colleges, universities and government departments in Lahore, Gujranwala and Islamabad, Pakistan. Analysis of the participants’ responses reveals categories and patterns which through contemplation and analysis brings meaning and coherence to the generated theme categories. These emerging themes are reported in this chapter, when patterns were formed from four or more responses. Affiliate themes resulting from patterns of fewer than four responses are also identified when they are of direct relevance to the study.

The structure of the chapter commences with the reporting of the data (as reduced), which is then followed by the analysis made. For reporting of the data, the interview questions have been grouped as follows:
### FINDINGS

1. **CHALLENGES, SUPPORT AND PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT ACCESS (QUESTIONS 1, 2, & 7)**

| Question 1: | As a teacher/teacher educator/designer, what challenges do you face in your teaching in adult education classroom/in conducting PD of teachers/designing PD? |
| Question 2: | In your institute, how often are teachers engaged or like to be engaged in PD? And, what level of engagement do they like to have? |
| Question 7: | Please comment on any problems in accessing good PD programmes for you professional development. |

These questions were designed to seek a fuller picture of the professional development in Pakistan. These questions created an opportunity for teachers to explore the type of challenges that they faced in their teaching.
of adults, to discuss their engagements in professional development that was available to them, and also to bring under discussion the problems that they faced in accessing professional development. Further explorations were attempted by asking these questions to professional development providers and designers.

The discussions that took place as a result of these questions facilitated teachers to reflect and talk generously about their day-to-day problems that they faced in their teaching, attitudes of new and experienced teachers while facing these problems, and the measures they adopted to confront these challenges. A strong element of frustration was evident when they verbalised their feelings of lack of infrastructural support in response to these difficult tasks which tested their ability and skills. These in detail were:

**Dealing with Passive Learners**

‘Passive learners’ was the major challenge that most of the interviewees (4 out of 6) faced in their daily practice. ‘Large, mixed ability classes’, ‘below average students’, ‘lack of motivation and reading habits’, ‘spoon feeding’ were some of the feelings shared. One of the interviewees dressed up her frustration: “Teachers are forced to come down to basics and spoon feed; otherwise nothing would sink in their heads” (Bilal-1).

**Lack of Support**

Amidst their challenges, lack of support was the dominant response of the interviewees (6 out of 6). They clearly felt unsupported as no infrastructural support or any professional development opportunity was made available within their institutions for their growth and development. Lack of pre-service and in-service education, unappreciative administration, their being overburdened with work and unable to figure out reasonable solutions to their practice-related problems, and not knowing where to go and who to ask in time of need, were the major issues raised which they believed seriously affected their performance.

Sairan expressed her feelings of abandonment and frustration:
At college level, it is expected because teachers have done their masters, therefore, they do not need any training or professional development. It is only through trial and error method that we develop. Take my example, for the last thirty years nobody has ever asked me if I needed any kind of professional support or help … (Sairan-1-7).

In this instance how teachers survived in their profession, Aroma expressed it: “… they are in swim or sink situation. In the absence of professional support, they [teachers] settle themselves with time in their own ways which may be against the spirit of their job. So, year after year, same teaching!” (Aroma-11).

**Inadequate Professional Development**

An overwhelming response came from the majority of respondents (5 out of 6) about the professional development being inadequate for teachers. College teachers were utterly devoid of any professional development opportunities; however teachers in universities had had available a short course, but that, too, was rare and not available easily. Viola asserted: “… if it is available, it is mostly stereotyped teacher training which does not respect teachers and furthermore, it is top down, old fashioned and mechanical” (Viola-2). Surriah, a professional development designer and a government representative, communicated her constraints: “We can’t provide training to everybody every year. After all NAHE is a project and it will have its end somewhere in 2011. It is very difficult for us to continue even from the first phase to the second. Why? - because of the financial crunch and the priorities” (Surriah-2).

**Inequitable Access**

Feelings of inequity were conveyed by most of the respondents (4 out of 6). No equal opportunity, favouritism, and a sense of deprivation were consistently echoed while they expressed their views to highlight this issue. Khushi raised this issue when he expressed: “the training opportunities are available only to a chosen few, who have good relationships perhaps with the department head or dean. Not everyone is nominated to go and attend” (Khushi-2). Surriah, a government representative, also endorsed
Khushi’s views by saying: “We keep begging universities that please don’t send the same person again - send us another person. What happens is … they keep sending same person again and again and the rest remain at a disadvantage” (Surriah-2).

**Lack of Self-Access Materials**

Lack of self-access materials as one of the major problems in accessing professional development was an overwhelming response of interviewees (5 out of 6). They accentuated the need of having latest books, relevant research journals, internet service, and printing facility within their own set-ups to keep them up-to-date in their fields and also to seek daily professional improvement.

**Absence of Leadership**

Non-cooperative and unappreciative administration was another major concern among most of the respondents (4 out of 6) when they spoke of the barriers in their way to professional development. Instead of building, sustaining, and communicating the school’s culture, ‘indifferent, unsupportive, and conventional leadership’ were the feelings reverberating across their responses. They stated that their administrations: “… don’t appreciate, encourage or support” (Bilal-7), and “after training we go back and try to replicate it, they set us aside and say, ‘you have had enough twenty four days fun, get back to teaching now’” (Surriah-1), and “… when they [teachers] come up with new ideas or innovations, they are resisted …” (Viola-1).

2. PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT NEEDS, RELEVANCE, AND PREFERENCES (QUESTIONS 4 & 5)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question 4.</th>
<th>Please comment on the last/current teacher professional development that you have attended/is attending. What did/do you like or dislike about it and why?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Question 5.</td>
<td>To what extent do the available PD programmes focus on teachers’ experiences and their needs?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
These questions (questions 4 and 5) were asked to gain a familiarity with how far the available professional development opportunities were consistent with the teachers’ needs and experiences. Their responses fell into the categories as follows:

**Largely Unrelated to Their Needs and Experiences**

The dominant response of the participants (5 out of 6) was that their professional development was largely incongruent, incoherent and unrealistic in regards to their authentic classroom experiences and a far cry from enabling them to rise up to their challenges. “Links are very weak”, “inflexible”, “tightly structured” and “irrelevant” were the voices heard consistently across their viewpoints. Khushi made it a point as he stated: “At the first place teachers’ professional needs are not targeted and then these courses never build on what teachers already know or have experienced” (Khushi-5). But there was a vivid note of optimism when he uttered: “… these are efforts but require improvements” (Khushi-5).

**No Involvement**

The majority (5 out of 6) raised the issues of ownership that professional development might achieve. They argued with such vehemence that teachers as the main stakeholders must have their say in the designing and implementation of these programmes. They made the prevailing system a point of their criticism for its being “top down and never bottom up” (Sairan-7). Aroma, a professional development provider and designer, when asked how she designed the programmes of professional development, disclosed: “Our vice chancellor comes up with certain lapses and lacking, that, in his views are our teachers’ needs, and I plan things on those lines” (Aroma-5). Viola attempted to capture the whole scene by elaborating:

> Every workplace, every situation is different. But what happens here is there is somebody who plans a training programme, right. The programme has to be delivered to teachers through master trainers. So they have designed a booklet which everybody is going to follow. So it is very structured (Viola-5).
**Information Based Design**

Most of the participants involved (4 out of 6) believed that the form of professional development that was available for them was largely packed with theoretical information that might or might not be what practitioners actually thought of professional development to achieve. “Lecture based” “passive learning”, “orientation type”, “transmission of a very general understanding of teaching” were the feelings which all the four participants conveyed grimly. When Surriah, a government representative, was asked about what in-service teachers, both novice and experienced, left the programme with, her response also revealed the superficial nature of these programmes. She illustrated:

> Our professional development program starts from the very module which focuses on teachers themselves – who are you; what are you; what your requirements are; what are your needs; and what are the expectations from you as a professional. … what are the pre-requisites before entering a class – properly planned, managed, and prepared with activities etc. are also discussed (Surriah- 5).

**Engagement with Peers**

When participants (4 out of 6) talked about what they preferred to do during professional development, they advocated: “establishing a culture of sharing”, group work and reflectivity”, “collaboration with their colleagues”, and “peer reviews”. Considerations of collaborative work with other colleagues led Aroma to reminisce about her early learning:

> … my principal was my mentor. As I did not have any initial training so I used to observe her, learn from her the way she used to do the things and sometimes would hold a dialogue to benefit from her experience. This type of learning was extremely practical and handy (Aroma-11).
3. PURPOSE OF PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (QUESTIONS 3 & 10)

| Question 3. | What do you consider to be the purpose of attending professional development programs? |
| Question 10. | Please reflect on the fundamental aim of professional development—should it be to provide a means of transmitting knowledge or facilitate teachers to transform and better their practices or something else? |

The questions above were designed to investigate what was important and valuable for the participants, what they believed the professional development was supposed to aim for, and what they hoped to achieve by a plan, action, or activity as a result. The discussions unfolded in the following four categories:

**Generic and Specific Teaching Skills**

A dominant response of the participants in the study (6 out of 6) brought to light their predilection for opportunities which endowed them with improvements in their teaching practices on a personal as well as social level. A firm opinion of Sairan revealed her choice for personal and social learning as a purpose of professional development: “Have more skills, have more knowledge, have more strategies to deal with difficult situations, [and] share these things (Sairan-3).” Adding to this point was Viola’s succinct response: “It should enhance your skills as a teacher, a practitioner and a researcher” (Viola-3). Participants were of the view that their professional development workshops merely focus on generic or put it singular methods rather than a range of teaching techniques. They believed generic teaching skills to be important to seek a multi-disciplinary approaches but in their opinion, will not be sufficient unless these skills are linked with the subject content. Khushi attempted to address this fine balance in his words:
I am not saying that we all need a set of same skills to teach different subjects. What I mean is, a teacher needs specific skills for a specific subject but it would be nice to sit sometime with a teacher from another subject or field too, have a conversation, see how they teach, listen to their experiences, and you never know, you find a practical solution to your problem in hand ... I have experienced it (Khushi-9)

Overall, participants’ responses were studded with generic and job-related themes like: maintain and grow their expertise as a classroom practitioner, learn and shape learner-centred, interactive classrooms, and seek the ability to understand and introduce innovative teaching methodologies.

**Self-Direction**
Self-direction as the purpose of professional development was another dominant opinion of the participants (5 out of 6). They liked professional development to make them autonomous learners by empowering and strengthening their own potential so that they could grow and develop on a daily basis.

**Linked with Change in Teachers’ Practice**
An overwhelming majority of participants in the study (5 out of 6) labelled the word ‘change’ with the outcomes of professional development. “To transform, to improve and to become a better practitioner” as a result of professional development were the unwavering reply of the participants. Developing this, Sairan argued that effective change would be the one that was linked with “you, your fellows, colleagues, and the professional communities” (Sairan-10). She reasoned further: “… so this way people start making their own decisions on a rational basis … and also learn to take the responsibility of their own actions and decisions” (Saira-10). Viola, sharing her own perspective, was of the view that a change in teachers’ practice had to be the outcome of professional development but “it could only come through on-going and continuous professional development and not through one-off” (Viola-10).
Linked with Change in Students’ Learning

It was also explained by most of the respondents (4 out of 6) that the element of change should shuttle back and forth – change in teachers’ practice should in turn be felt in their classrooms also. Aroma supported the connection between teachers’ growth and development and its influence on their students’ learning, when she talked about the type of transformation that should take place and who should be the beneficiaries: “Transformation in teachers’ knowledge and skills should benefit students and their learning” (Aroma-10).

4. CHARACTERISTICS OF EFFECTIVE PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (QUESTION 6)

| Question 6 | What do you consider to be the characteristics of effective and ineffective professional development currently being offered to the teachers of adults? |

This question facilitated generous discussions on the description of professional development and its main qualities that could best fit the likes of the teachers and their professional needs. The copious supply of ideas which participants shared about the particular combination of its qualities delineated the following categories:

Local Control

The responses of five out of six participants were in the favour of seeing professional development as a regular feature of their institutions and their jobs. They reasoned that this key feature would render professional development a characteristic of something being more practical, handy, continuous, and available to everybody at their door step. Surriah, while talking about how hard it was for teachers to discontinue their jobs and dislodge from their families to attend professional development in other cities, advocated its availability in their own institutions:
Colleges and universities should have a separate continuous professional development centre. So if it is a part of their own system, they will be able to have continuous professional development according to their own schedule (Surriah-1).

While arguing about its advantages to teachers, Sairan and Bilal identified: “addressing their local needs on regular basis” and “on-going with quick follow-ups” (Surriah-8; Bilal-4).

**Collaborative and Experiential Learning**
Almost all of the respondents (5 out of 6) clearly gave their preferences for a collaborative and experiential learning as a significant feature of professional development. Their responses resounded with “discovery and experiential learning”, “interactive and participative”, “learning by doing”, “finding out their own strengths and abilities”, “sharing knowledge and sharing skills” in an attempt to create a portrayal of professional development which was more consistent with their professional needs and relevant with their contexts.

**Evaluation Focus**
Evaluation was another characteristic of professional development which was supported by four out of six participants. They were of the view that evaluation, both formative and summative, must function on regular basis as a complementary means of determining the success of professional development. “Good monitoring and evaluation system must be in place” were the words of Viola when she expressed her strong desire for adopting necessary measures to make development initiatives a permanent feature of her workplace culture:

Problem here is, at first place, things don’t start and if they do, nobody is there to look after them; everybody is interested in point scoring! That is why we never know whether or not they would continue and be there tomorrow. So, I would be very happy if somebody could ensure me that, for example, professional development starts and be there for us, whenever we need, without a problem (Viola-6 & 12).
Evaluation, as they highlighted it, must examine how teachers reacted to development initiatives, how students benefited from their learning and in turn how the professional development opportunities as a whole performed and, as Khushi mentioned, what “shortcomings and pitfalls needed to be studied and improved” (Khushi-3).

5. Forms of Professional Development and Their Relevance (Question 8)

| Question 8. During a professional development program, think about these situations: |
|---------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| - Teachers sit and only attend to a teacher educator talking about effective teaching skills. |
| - Professional colleagues work together and develop each others' teaching skills. |
| - Teachers, individually or with a teacher educator, learn by doing and by reflecting about their teaching? |

This question was asked to discuss with the participants a few forms of professional development from transmissive to transformative in purpose and their views were sought on what they considered would be more appropriate and effective in their growth and development. This question met with propitious discussions as below:

**Reflective and Experiential**

A dominant response of the participants (5 out of 6) was in favour of reflective and experiential learning as an effective form of professional development. Besides vehemently supporting reflective and experiential learning, they also endorsed the idea of collaboration; for instance, Sairan ascribed the value of both, learning through doing and reflection and though collaboration: “…we all reflect but if we could do it formally together – think, reflect and then discover what is wrong and then try something different…” (Sairan-8). Khushi, discussing the attributes of
reflective learning, held that it was “the best form of professional development; best practice to continuously improve and learn” (Khushi-8). Surriah specifically liked to mention “action research” that every practitioner might be trained in.

**Rejection of Top-Down Transmission**
Five out of six participants clearly rejected as ineffective and irrelevant the traditional form of professional development. This can be learnt from Viola’s definite instance: “In fact the transmissive one is old fashioned, conventional and in reality, it’s past now” (Viola-9).

Bilal, however, espoused the idea of introducing a nice combination of all the three, traditional, collaborative and reflective forms of professional development (Bilal-8). He articulated his opinion through a very calm and assured voice:

> I would not advise one particular method because we learn in many different ways. You can learn from a teacher, you can learn from your well-informed colleague, you can learn on your own or with the help of a supervisor. So a collective form of professional development which is both formal and informal can be more practical and useful (Bilal-8).

When asked to name the one that could best fit the practice and the context, a majority of them again voted for “Teachers, individually or with a facilitator, learn by doing and by reflecting about their teaching”. Nearly all of them extolled the usefulness of the ‘communities of practice’ form of professional development. However, some of them had reservations, too, about its implementation today as the sole form of professional development; for example, “I don’t know whether we are at the right stage for it” (Viola-8).
6. ACHIEVEMENTS AS A RESULT OF PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT (QUESTION 9)

| Question 9. To what extent do you think professional development should help teachers achieve or gain: |
| - theoretical knowledge and ideas, |
| - teaching activities, |
| - ability to be able to decide about their teaching and learning strategies? |

When asked what teachers should achieve or attain as a result of professional development, their responses came as:

**Holistic Learning**
Most of the participants (4 out of 6) emphatically supported a combination of all the three i.e. acquisition of theoretical and practical knowledge, and development of an ability to make independent decisions. “A good mix of all the three! It will be more of holistic in its form” (Bilal-9) was the opinion of Bilal. Khushi developed it further by stating: “… decision making will come when one has a good grasp of the basic concepts, then you have an experience of activities – which activity was better, human factors, processing, time management etc., then you can reach an informed decision” (Khushi-9).

7. Final Comments (Question 11)

| Question 11. Do you have final comments to make on professional development for teachers of adults? |

As final comments, the participants’ responses took the following shape:
**Teachers as Main Stakeholders**

Four out of six participants established the need to acknowledge teachers as the main stakeholders; therefore, they must be involved in identifying their own needs, and in the planning and implementation of their professional development.

**Coherent Policy**

Most of the respondents (4 out of 6) also indicated that a coherent policy must be devised for the professional development of the teachers of adults in Pakistan. Pre-service education, as Aroma argued, must be made compulsory for the new entrants in the profession so that professional development could focus more on the practical side of teaching and the profession (Aroma-11).

**ANALYSIS**

The analysis below weaves together different strands of the participants’ responses to surface various themes that assist in the design of professional development in Pakistan.

**Lack of Professional Support**

Analysis of the participants’ responses (Sections 1, 2 and 7) reveals the emergent theme of *Unhappiness* as they unleashed a persistent critique, across their responses, on the present situation of professional development in Pakistan. Unsupported, not involved, inadequate, unrelated: these were the dominant opinions of the participants, while most of them indicated inequitable, information-based and lack of coherent policy, as major issues. Of these, ‘inadequate’ and ‘unrelated’ were the two repeatedly mentioned.

The participants in the study were of the view that their professional development was highly incongruent, incoherent and impractical for their authentic classroom experiences and a far cry from enabling them to meet their challenges. They strongly felt of these issues as factors which seriously affect the quality of education in general and their performances.
as practitioners in particular. Also, their persistent critique of professional
development in Pakistan indicates their unhappiness and their desire for change. What could this change look like? We turn to this now.

\textit{Site-Based Provision}

The data suggests the theme of \textit{site-based} (colleges/universities) professional development (Sections 1 and 4). While discussing their problems in accessing professional development and delineating its characteristics that best identified with their needs, an overwhelming majority of the participants were in favour of making professional development available at their school level. They believe this would enable them to be a part of professional development that was more relevant, frequent, and built on their prior experiences.

In this regard, they brought to the discussion two key points. Firstly, they contended that their institutions must have permanent arrangements for professional development which could be in the form of specialist centres. Secondly, they underlined the significance of making self-access materials, like the latest books and relevant research journals, available for teachers to ensure their continued professional development within their own contexts. Further, teachers’ concerns about lack of time were also considered surmountable this way.

The participants’ perceptions of site-based professional development also embodied a need for supportive and appreciative roles from the leadership. Most of the respondents stipulated that their administration must extend their support in building, sustaining, and communicating culture of sustained learning and development. So, to them, professional development available within their local control, which is further complemented by supportive policies, strong leadership, sufficient resources and a positive climate within their institutions would be a great success in providing the means of addressing teachers’ professional development needs at a local level and on a regular basis.
**Social Learning as the Pedagogy**

Based on details of the participants’ responses (Sections 2, 4 and 5) when they narrated their past experiences related to professional development, its characteristics and forms, a theme of social learning emerges. A majority of participants expressed their favourable regard for the importance of developing a collaborative culture within their workplaces. According to the participants, the professional development to be designed for them should incorporate the opportunities to share and reflect upon their strengths and weaknesses, and learn from them with the help and support of their peers. They regarded collaboration between colleagues as a convenient and a valuable mode of mutual growth and development within their own set-ups rather than looking outside for external help.

Nearly all of them preferred the idea of reflective learning individually, through peer partnerships and networks, and with the assistance of experts or specialists in the field. Their great reverence for reflective practices as an effective and efficient approach of professional development was evident in their responses. The participants valued learning through critiquing their own practice – re-examining, renewing, observing and holding reflective dialogue with their peers, and considered it highly important and practical in refining their teaching skills and solving their classroom problems.

**Generic and Discipline-based Teaching Skill Formation**

On analysing the responses in Sections 3, 4, 5 and 6 another theme, that of personalised generic teaching skill formation, unfolds. The thoughts, ideas, concerns, and perspectives which participants shared while discussing the purpose of professional development, generated vivid indications of personalised generic teaching skills as their professional needs, which any programs or opportunities of professional development needed to target. To transform, to improve, and to become a better teacher, practitioner, and a researcher were the dominant opinions expressed.

Their responses clearly indicated the value they gave to self-directed, reflective, and experiential learning. To them professional development must make teachers autonomous learners by empowering and
strengthening their own potential and abilities so that they could grow and develop their specific practices on a daily basis.

During professional development they wished to work in groups with their peers and learn through doing and by reflecting upon their previous experiences. It was apparent from their opinions that they overwhelmingly desired holistic learning as was evident when they voted for both acquisition of theoretical and practical knowledge as well as development of abilities to take practice-related professional decisions more independently.

**Evaluation**

A close investigation of the data categories as in Section 3 and 4 brings to surface the theme of *Evaluation*. To manage the system and the process of learning appropriately, the respondents called for putting monitoring and evaluation system in deliberate order. Evaluation, as most of them explained, would help pay explicit attention to certain key aspects like how teachers reacted to development initiatives, how students benefited from their learning and in turn how the professional development opportunities as a whole performed and, what shortcomings and pitfalls needed to be studied and improved. So there were clear indications of introducing evaluation to the design of professional development so that its efficiency could be tested on a regular basis.

They asked for linking professional development not only with change in teachers’ practices but also with improvements in their students’ learning. In other words, they suggested that besides examining teachers’ voices and their valuable feedback, improvements in their students’ performances and learning would also act as instruments of measuring the efficiency of the professional development opportunities or programs in operation.

**CONCLUSION**

This chapter, through the identification of the findings and analysis of the data, has generated five themes: Unhappiness, Site-Based Provision, Social
Learning as the Pedagogy, Generic and Discipline-based Teaching Skill Formation, and Evaluation. These themes together portray a new conception of professional development which emerges from the voices of the participants in the study.

The first theme Lack of Professional Support denotes the element of change that teachers in Pakistan desire in the present professional development practices and also strongly supports the rationale of this study discussed in Chapter 1. The second theme Site-Based Provision discusses its modus operandi. It presents a refusal of externally-imposed professional development and an affirmation of yielding it up to local control. Thirdly, the theme of Social Learning as the Pedagogy suggests engagement and close collaboration as its distinctive mark. The fourth theme Generic and Discipline-based Teaching Skill Formation identifies what is important and valuable to teachers as purposes which professional development should aim to achieve, and, finally, the theme of Evaluation explains how to ensure and sustain it by introducing evaluation to measure its efficiency on a regular basis.

These emergent themes are discussed in Chapter 6, Discussion.
CHAPTER SIX

DISCUSSION

This chapter will look at each of the five emergent themes listed in Chapter 5. Accordingly, this chapter comprises two parts. In the first part, the findings have been discussed under each theme in the light of the claims generated in Chapter 2 through a critical review of particular bodies of scholarship. In the second part, using the results of this study, a model of effective professional development has been generated and its various features have been identified and explained.

DISCUSSION

THEME ONE: LACK OF PROFESSIONAL SUPPORT

The theme of lack of professional support recurred throughout the participants’ responses as they unleashed a persistent critique of the present situation related to their professional development in Pakistan. This emergent theme acts as a prologue to the results of this qualitative case study. Their responses unfolded four key aspects: the type of challenges that they are facing, the professional support or assistance that is available to them, the design of the existing professional development,
and the measures that they considered can improve the situation. We have discussed these in order as follows:

Their challenges, although appearing to be multi-faceted, yet were mainly related to their classroom teaching. Of these, the most noticeable was their being overburdened, unappreciated, and unsupported which, they felt, was further aggravated by the passive learners that they deal with everyday in their large, mixed ability classes. As they expressed it, there existed no support within their setups to assist them in rising up to their challenges. Making the situation worse for them was the fact that most of the teachers in colleges and universities did not have any pre-service teacher education at the time of their entering the profession. This was demoralizing and had seriously undermined their work.

Commenting on the design and quality of externally-delivered professional development for university teachers, an overwhelming majority considered this to be a top-down, old fashioned, mechanistic view of professional development, which lacked respect for teachers and their learning needs. Their displeasure with the traditional form of professional development is supported by McLaughlin and Zarrow (2001) who believe that teachers’ professional development should be a constructivist rather than a transmission-oriented experience for teachers and must assume teachers as active learners. Furthermore, the participants raised the issue of inequitable and unjust access to even this sort of professional development. As participation in these events was on a nomination-basis which, they believed, was never fair and equal, there were many who had never had any professional development in their long teaching career. A professional development designer, heading a government training department, illustrated the status quo by sharing a few statistics. These statistics revealed that her department had only been able to offer the ‘Staff Development Course’ to 9.8% of college and university teachers in these years. Also, there were many instances when the same teachers were nominated more than once.

Professional development, besides being inadequate and inequitable, was largely unrelated to their teaching experiences and needs. They always felt
the programme was too tightly structured and highly inflexible to entertain their interests and issues. Research reveals quite the opposite of this inflexibility. For example, Borko & Putnam (1995) and Holland (2005) are of the view that for professional development initiatives to be valuable and fruitful, their design has to be congruent with teachers’ contexts and their practices. According to the participants, the information-based design of professional development had very little to offer to them, and was the least that they considered to be the target of professional development. They in fact liked active involvement, not only in the identification of their needs, but also in the designing and implementation of professional development programmes for them. This is what Darling-Hammond (1998) advocated when discussing new policy and planning related to professional development: coherence with particular contexts, needs and activities of teachers.

The need for devising a coherent policy for professional development for college and university teachers was deeply felt and strongly suggested by the participants. They believed that teachers, being the main stakeholders, must act and play a central role in this regard. They also suggested that seeking a certain level of teacher education be made mandatory for new entrants, so that professional development for them could focus and build more on their classroom needs and experiences. Darling-Hammond et al. (2005) provides support for this view that courses, if designed without considering the conception of teaching and learning, would remain ineffective in bringing about any change in teachers’ beliefs and practices. Furthermore, Daley (2003) refers to Dreyfus and Dreyfus (1985), Pratt (1998), and Merriam & Caffarella (1999), in her argument that professional development that considers teachers’ needs, suitable learning and teaching orientations, and teachers’ career stages, can prove highly effective in facilitating change in their practice and increasing student learning. For this to happen, Lawler and King (2000, p. 6) propose that we need to “move away from a deficit model of development toward one of professional development and growth”.

75
THEME TWO: SITE-BASED PROVISION OF PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

Our research found that teachers, professional development providers and designers clearly valued site-based provision of professional development and considered it more appropriate and suitable to their contexts as well as to their learning needs. They believed that their workplaces, if transformed into more nurturing, supportive, and flexible environments, can undoubtably ensure their sustained development and growth. The cultivation of such supportive contexts and communities will provide them professional development which is more realistic, accessible, continual, and equitable.

Teachers, as the participants stated, can explore situated learning within their own institutions and the groups of individuals by sharing their practical experiences of working. They suggested that colleges and universities have their own professional development centre for their ongoing development. They further added, if it is a part of their own system, they will be able to have continuing professional development according to their own schedule. This provision at a local level will, as stated by another respondent, address their local needs on a regular basis.

Furthermore, the site-led provision of professional development can make learning happen both for novice and expert teachers within their own domains and through a variety of ways without disrupting or dislodging them from normal routines for the sake of attending workshops in bigger cities. In fact, the sharing that can result out of a site-based design can spread good practice within the school and beyond, empower the novice to be more knowledgeable and experienced, enable accomplished teachers to stay current, and make it possible for the teaching community to generate new knowledge. This is supported by Wenger (1998), Little (1999), Jenlink and Kinnucan-Welsch (1999), Stein, Smith and Silver (1999), King and Newman, (2000), McLaughlin and Zarrow (2001), and Piggot-Irvine (2004).
Little (1999, p. 253), for instance, argues that in contexts where professional development is a necessary part of school life, the workplace cultural norm is ‘learning enriched’ and ‘teachers form a disposition toward their own learning in the fabric of daily school work’. On the contrary,

if a teacher does not work in a professional learning community where teachers work collaboratively, sharing passion and purpose for their work, then professional development is short-lived (Fullan and Mascall cited in Piggot-Irvine, 2004, p. 480).

In the context of site-led provision of professional development, the study revealed that, besides the formation of professional communities, there is an immense need to consolidate it further by providing two-way support. This support should include the provision of the latest self-access materials, like books and journals, to teachers and encouraging roles of school leadership. Firstly, almost all of the participants acknowledged that, besides benefiting from mutually supportive relationship within their workplaces, it is of fundamental importance to have access to the expertise of researchers to broaden their reflection, thinking and repertoire. This is established by Poskitt (2001) and King and Newman (2000) when they addressed the issue of building school capacity through professional development.

Secondly, the fieldwork recognised the concerned, supportive, and unconventional roles that leadership needs to perform to build, sustain, and communicate their school’s culture. This central and educative role of leadership will go a long way in articulating a vision, promoting shared ownership, and overall establishing and nurturing a culture of mutual development and growth. This is exactly in line with what Piggot-Irvine (2004, p. 11) argues in the claim that development is phenomenal when the leadership:

has an enormous appetite to reflect, learn and develop themselves, and create opportunities for others to learn and
develop … this learning, however, is not dissipated. The focus is usually linked to clearly established goals that have been collaboratively developed for the school.

The study, thus, discloses that the professional development, available within teachers’ local control, complemented by supportive policies, promising leadership, sufficient reading materials, and a positive climate within their institutions, would be more befitting in providing the means to address their learning and development needs at a local level, and on a regular basis.

**THEME THREE: SOCIAL LEARNING AS THE PEDAGOGY**

The study indicated that the participants cherished social learning as the pedagogy. They expressed their liking for developing cultures of collegial support within their workplaces. These cultures of mutual growth and development should provide profound opportunities to all teachers to get together, share and reflect upon their strengths and weaknesses, and learn with the help and support of their peers. This pedagogy which is collaborative, active, connected, and on-going was considered suitable for their purposes and needs. Their preference for social learning as the pedagogy was clearly evident in their responses when they addressed the issue of what they liked to do for their professional development, such as, sharing, group work, peer reviews, and reflectivity. Research is filled with information on the importance of developing a collaborative culture within a learning organization. The works of Darling-Hammond & McLaughlin (1995), Cobb & Bowers (1999), Hawley & Valli (1999), Garet, et al. (2001), Lawler (2003), Dobrovolny (2006), and Merriam & Caffarella (2007) resonate with the beliefs shared by the participants in the study.

The study further illuminated the precise nature of the social learning to which the participants felt inclined. An overwhelming majority preferred learning which was through more holistic means and a reflective in nature. Put another way, this is engagement, which is from individual to social, and vice versa and which is also aided by the experiences and observations.
of the experts in the field. This is supported by Bell & Gilbert (1996), Stein, Smith & Silver (1999), King and Newmann (2001), Clarke & Hollingswood (2002), and Fraser, et al. (2007).

Hill et al. (2002) also supports this view of professional development. The authors have extended five key factors in the success of professional development. Such as: engaging in deep learning (understanding through reflection, creating knowledge, and transforming it into action); and observing and networking with peers. Stein, Smith & Silver’s (1999, p. 239) ‘a new paradigm for professional development’ also agrees with it. To them, professional development which is embedded in work cultivates communities of professional practice.

The participants’ views of reflective learning individually, through peer partnerships and networks, and with the assistance of experts or specialists in the field can be viewed further through the lens which various authors have provided in the context of professional development designs. This type of engagement matches with Stein, Smith and Silver’s (1999) inside-outside models of professional development. It also resonates with Kennedy’s (2005) ‘transitional’ spectrum of professional development designs, e.g. mentoring and a community of practice model, with increasing amount of professional autonomy. ‘Transitional’ design as stated by Kennedy, has the capacity to oscillate between transmissive and transformative designs. Put another way, transitional design supports the process of acculturation into an established community of practice, where teachers construct knowledge by conversing with others, analysing problems, identifying solutions, and meeting goals together. It can benefit from engaging expert tuition, like workshops, to focus on technical aspects of the job. In addition, it can profit from transformational designs, like action research, to enjoy huge professional autonomy in internalising new concepts, reflecting on their practice, constructing new knowledge and applying it in their contexts.

This holistic and reflective approach to professional development can offer profound learning for both novice and accomplished teachers in the
context of their teaching practice. But skills are often the ways holism is articulated, to which we now turn.

**THEME FOUR: GENERIC AND DISCIPLINE-BASED TEACHING SKILL FORMATION**

According to Knapp (2003, p. 12), the most immediate goal of professional development is professional learning: “changes in thinking, knowledge, skills and approaches to instruction that form practicing teachers’ or administrators’ repertoire”. Elmore (2002) is of the view that professional development planning may start with a common goal – to help teachers to attain insights, knowledge, and skills to better their and their students’ learning. These broad goals, according to the author, must then be followed by a list of programme objectives which could describe explicitly,

what new knowledge and skills educators will learn as a consequence of their participation, how this knowledge and skills will be manifested in their professional practice, and what specific activities will lead to this learning” (Elmore, 2002, p. 8).

Based on our fieldwork, three elements appear to be fundamental in the context of what teachers wish to do during professional development and what teachers should achieve as an outcome of professional development. First of all, teachers needed to gain and continually excel in pedagogical understandings to be able to rise up to their challenges and become effective classroom teachers, better able to increase student learning. Secondly, teachers needed opportunities that offered holistic learning to them. For better teaching and student learning, they liked professional development that empowers them with theoretical knowledge and ideas, lets them experiment to see how these manifest in classrooms, and, more importantly, creates and nurtures decision making skills to determine teaching and learning strategies autonomously. This was the direct illustration of what they actually meant by pedagogical understandings.
Thirdly, to do so, teachers needed to be reflective and experiential in their approach to continuous learning and development.

All of the study participants supported the acquisition of generic and discipline-based teaching skill formation as a direct result of professional development. Skills included were, in particular, but not limited to, knowledge of learning environments and instructional strategies, classroom management, knowledge of learners and learning, creation of learner-centred, interactive climate in classrooms, problem solving, decision making skills, research skills, were the areas, they emphasised. The studies of Marsh (1994), Hawley and Valli (1999), Knapp (2004), Devlin (2007), and Kember and McNaught (2007) provide support for this. Knapp (2003), for example, believes that:

high quality professional development must concentrate on classroom teaching, focus on building teachers’ pedagogical content knowledge, model preferred instructional practices (e.g. active learning), locate professional learning in collaborative, collegial – and generally school-based – learning environments, offer rigorous opportunities for professional development over time, and align with reform initiatives (p. 119).

Moreover, during professional development, an overwhelming majority of participants preferred reflective and experiential approaches as most befitting and useful for their learning. One of the participants held that reflection was the best practice to continuously improve and learn as a teacher. When asked to indicate professional development practice that could best fit their work and the context, the majority preferred learning by doing, and by reflecting on their teaching individually, or with the help of a facilitator. The participants, as a whole, believed that, as reflective practitioners, they would be more self-directed, autonomous learners to assume the responsibility of their development. There is copious amount of literature available that supports these opinions of the participants: Schön (1991 and 1996), Darling-Hammond & McLaughlin (1995), Hill et
Lambert (2003), for example, considers dialogue and reflection as one of the activities that can make professional development effective. While discussing the factors that contribute to making professional development work, the first element that Hill et al. (2002) lists is engaging in deep, rather than shallow learning. Deep learning, according to Bush and Glover (2003, p. 17), is based on reflecting (individual and shared), constructing new knowledge, and, then, transforming it into action. Darling-Hammond & McLaughlin, (1995) further illuminate the process of reflection.

Furthermore, nearly all of the participants clearly rejected the traditional form of professional development as it was an ineffective, irrelevant, top-down, and transmission-oriented design of professional development. They believed that for lasting change to take place in their teaching practice and student learning, professional development ought to be continuous, embedded in practice and context, professionally informed, sustained and, as Hill et al. (2002) put it, deep in its orientation.

**THEME FIVE: EVALUATION**

At two different places, the majority of participants referred to evaluation, both formative and summative, as a complementary means of determining the success of professional development. Firstly, their regard for evaluation was implied in their interview responses when they discussed the element of ‘change’ in their teaching practices and student learning as a consequence of their participation in professional development. To improve, to transform, and to become a better practitioner was the overwhelming response of the majority of the participants. Furthermore, they also emphasised that the element of change should shuttle back and forth – change in teachers’ practice should in turn be felt in their classrooms also. Secondly, addressing the characteristics of effective professional development, they explicitly indicated this need to have a system of evaluation in the design of professional development which
could investigate its merit or worth. They believed the presence of evaluation in the design will go a long way in investigating how professional development programmes or opportunities are performing, how far they are successful in serving the intended purposes, and what interventions might be needed for their improvement. This is supported by ERO (2000), Guskey (2000), Tallerico (2005) and Piggot-Irvine (2006).

The studies of Guskey (2000), in particular, resonate with the viewpoints of the study participants. Their asking for a good monitoring and evaluation system for studying and improving shortcoming or pitfalls in the professional development initiatives, corresponds with what Guskey argues: “making a difference through five critical levels of evaluation” (Guskey, 2000, p. 45). According to the author, for professional development to be a purposeful endeavour, i.e. whether a professional development has contributed to some gains in teacher and student learning, a system of evaluation has to be a central component of its design. A systematic gathering and analyse of information related to participants’ reactions, participants’ learning, organization support and change, participants’ use of new knowledge and skills, and student learning outcomes, can enhance the success of professional development everywhere (Guskey, 2000).

STUDY RESULTS AND THE CONTEXT

Our research is a modest but sincere contribution towards the betterment of professional development practices in Pakistan. This research, limited in scope, has documented the voices of the teachers to highlight the form of professional development that they believe can transform their practices, and thereby enhance student learning. In the next part below, these results have been used to generate a model of effective professional development for teachers of adults in Pakistan.
A NEW MODEL OF EFFECTIVE PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT

In this part, we have woven the emergent themes of our research together to generate a model of effective professional development for teachers of adults in Pakistan (Appendix H). Shown in Figure 6.1, this model, built on the teachers’ voices gathered during our fieldwork in Pakistan and analysed using a Miles and Huberman (1994) style grid, presents the results of our study in a new way. It acknowledges site-based provision of professional development and expresses recognition of social learning as the pedagogy. One strength of the model is that it introduces a new pedagogy which is in sheer contrast to what is currently being practised in Pakistan – that being deficit-oriented professional development which is designed and delivered by external agencies without paying any heed to the teachers’ and the contexts’ needs and requirements. As revealed by our fieldwork, lack of each of relevance, authentic experiences, professional autonomy, ownership, interest, and motivation were the key factors causing dissatisfaction and disinclination among teachers towards their professional development practice.

By contrast, this model of professional development is more dynamic, systematic, focused, and engaging. It promotes the process of acculturation within teachers’ own workplaces and facilitates teachers in thus-formed communities to do what is best for themselves and for the whole group. Through this approach, teachers, individually and socially, foster the growth of continuing development by reflecting and holding dialogue, analysing problems, identifying solutions and applying them in their classrooms for better student learning. This model attains its sustainability in a number of ways – organic rather than sudden growth nurtured by teachers’ increased sense of ownership and the administrators’ supportive roles; practice-focused teacher learning and development through reflection individually, collectively, and with the assistance of experts; and, a system of evaluation for transparent and efficient functioning. Now we turn to explaining this model of professional development and its various features.
EXPLANATION: INSIDE–OUT

Moving from the inside-out, this model of professional development can be divided into its four main sections. We will discuss these sections by explaining their exclusive as well as inclusive features to show not only their individual properties, but also how they function together in the real world to create active learning and development opportunities for teachers.
Figure 6.2: The first section of the model: individual and social learning.

Figure 6.3: The second section of the model: the role of school leadership.
The first section of this model, shown in Figure 6.2, illustrates the two inter-connected personal and the social aspects of teachers’ professional development. This model, recognising teachers’ personal aspects, i.e. their individual beliefs, values, and attitudes, influences them to collaborate and establish their community of practice to meet their goals together. In a culture of sharing, they learn through reflective and experiential means. By this, we mean, through peer partnerships and networks, they observe, review and evaluate their practices, hold reflective dialogue with their colleagues, examine the nature of their problems, identify solutions, and thus create new knowledge and meanings. To manifest change in their students, they return to their classrooms where they operate individually to implement new knowledge, evaluate its outcomes, and review it for the best results. In the process of development, the teachers again network with their peers, thus the cycle of continuing learning and development goes on.
The second section of the model, shown in Figure 6.3, deals with the role of college and university administration in the site-based professional development. This model acknowledges leadership involvement and identifies multiple tasks that college and university leadership should perform to build, nurture, and sustain a culture of continuing professional development within their schools. The model characterises a supportive, caring and nurturing leadership that not only creates opportunities for teachers to continuously learn and develop, but also communicate this culture of mutual growth within and across the school. In so doing, the school leadership makes concrete and effective plans for teachers to lessen their burdens, to establish regular communications with faculty in order to assess their development needs, and to create for them a more coherent and focused atmosphere so that they achieve their development goals through trust, respect, and collegiality. In addition, school leadership provides self-access materials like books and journals to teachers so that they could benefit from them in broadening their knowledge, reflection, thinking, and repertoire. Furthermore, the school leadership takes measures in establishing contacts and networks with other colleges and universities to share their best practice and benefit from their expertise. What is more, the model recognises and gives huge importance to the role of school leadership in enabling teachers to socialise and network with their peers to acquire learning dispositions and mutual engagement. Thus, Figure 6.3 denotes continuity of the culture of mutual learning, growth and development within a school, which is only possible when leadership is friendly, understanding and supportive towards teachers and their community which they form.

Another important section of this model is the component of evaluation, undertaken internally or externally, to probe the merit or worth of professional development. As is shown in Figure 6.4, the placement of evaluation as an outer circle to college and university indicates its two-way functioning. Firstly, it helps school administration and teachers to investigate the effectiveness of professional development – whether or not professional development is helpful for teachers to learn and develop, how far it is successful in enabling teachers to improve their teaching skills, how successful teachers are in implementing changes in their
classrooms to improve their student learning, and what support or change is further needed from the school administration to make it more efficient and sustainable. Secondly, it provides means for government education authorities, who provide funding, to understand the usefulness and effectiveness of professional development for school, teachers, and students, and to evaluate whether their investment is earning concrete results.

The two outermost half-dotted circles back in Figure 6.1 denote the roles that government education authorities and other colleges and universities perform with respect to professional development of teachers. Government education authorities, besides acting as supervisory and monitoring bodies, are the main sources of funding for the regular functioning of colleges and universities as well as for professional development and its tributaries. In regard to professional development, they allocate special funds to colleges and universities to establish a culture of continuing teacher support and assistance, to enable teachers to form communities of teaching practice for their mutual growth and development, and also to procure library resources for teachers’ self-access. Quite in contrast to the current status quo of professional development in Pakistan - where government authorities are designers, developers, deliverers, and evaluators - teachers and school leadership, in this model, are the designers and deliverers of professional development, and the government education authorities perform more of a peripheral but important role by providing moral and financial support.

Furthermore, this site-based design acknowledges the important role of networking with other neighbouring colleges and universities. These institutional networks can be highly worthwhile in time of need. For example, there may be instances where teachers come across certain gaps which their community may not fill. In this case, the neighbouring colleges and universities can be approached to provide assistance which may be in the form of people or library resources to meet the emerging needs.
EXPLANATION: OUTSIDE-IN

A critical feature of this site-based model is that each of the sections discussed above needs to operate positively in order to achieve the best results from professional development. On the part of government education authorities, the provision of a cohesive professional development policy which is complemented by dedicated allocation of funds is required for the continuation of professional development. Secondly, along-side socio-constructivist learning and development within their own colleges and universities, networking with the neighbouring institutions needs to be established for the purpose of sharing best practice and for benefiting from each other’s experiences and expertise. Thirdly, evaluation, undertaken both by internal as well as external agencies, has to be frequent, transparent, and efficient in order to investigate the effectiveness of professional development on a regular basis and to introduce, where and when needed, improvements to enhance its success. Furthermore, a visionary and sustained assistance from college and university leadership is essential to foster the growth of development culture within their schools and to nurture a disposition in teachers as continuing learners and developers. Finally, on the part of teachers, a spirit of inquiry and sustained enthusiasm is crucial to not only examine their own teaching and its contexts, but also open up their classrooms for others to share and learn, and ultimately better their students’ learning.

CONCLUSION

From the results of our study, it is evident that professional development for teachers of adults in Pakistan must be site-based, promoting individual as well as social learning as the pedagogy. The model of professional development generated in the light of the results of our study is a reflection of teachers’ voices in Pakistan and is supported by the literature on professional development. As such, it is a modest attempt towards establishing an understanding of professional development that can deliver and produce positive results for teachers’ continuing development.
In the context of preparing a new vision of professional development for the teachers of adults in Pakistan, this model can be used by the government education authorities, the policy makers, the college and university administrations, and by the professional development designers and providers.

In the final chapter, we will present and discuss our conclusions to the present study, making recommendations drawn from it.
CHAPTER SEVEN

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This study aimed to address the question: How are professional development opportunities for Pakistani tertiary/higher education teachers currently experienced, and what changes, if any, should be made?

In addressing this question, the data was collected from teachers, professional development providers and designers in Pakistan, and analysed using a Miles and Huberman (1994) style grid to surface categories and themes. The analysis of the data revealed five themes: lack of professional support, site-based provision, social learning as the pedagogy, generic and discipline-based teaching skill formation, and evaluation. These themes were explored in Chapter 6 to produce results and to generate a model of effective professional development. This chapter presents our conclusions to the present study and the recommendations drawn from them.

ANSWERING THE RESEARCH QUESTION

This study was undertaken to gain insight into what teachers of adults,
professional development providers and designers thought about the current professional development practices and to explore what changes could be made to improve them. During our fieldwork, conducted in 2011 in Pakistan, all of the study participants expressed their displeasure and disapproval of the currently available professional development practices. They considered them as sporadic and incongruent with their classroom experiences, development needs, and the contexts. They explored, in detail, their professional challenges and needs, supports and resources, and their perceptions of the professional development which they considered can be more suitable to their needs and their contexts. Therefore, based on our research, we have concluded that the professional development practices for teachers of adults in Pakistan need to be reformed. These reforms should draw on the following points:

1. To develop and grow, and to improve student learning, teachers need professional development opportunities that are continuing, site-based, and which support learning through reflection and in other experiential ways.
2. Teachers need to improve generic and discipline-based teaching skills and, to do so, they need to work closely with their colleagues to benefit from individual, as well as social, aspects of their professional work.
3. Site-based provision of professional development opportunities needs to be evaluated on a regular basis to make it more effective, rewarding and sustainable for the schools, the teachers, and the students.

These three elements (presented in Figure 6.1 in Chapter 6) are of fundamental importance in providing the fabric for the reform agenda aiming to fashion a focused and sustained strategy for teachers of adults’ professional development in Pakistan. As suggested by the results of our study, policies should be devised to introduce professional development at college and university levels for a number of practical reasons. This site-based professional development should spring from fiscal, human and intellectual support provided by the government education authorities and by school leadership. It should aim to nurture the cultures of communication, reflection, sharing and learning within and among
workplaces and provide stimulating environments to better such teachers’ learning, classroom practices, and ultimately students’ learning.

LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

1. This study is bounded by the professional development of college and university teachers in Pakistan. It makes no claims for school teachers.

2. This study took place in the Punjab province including Lahore, Gujranwala, and Islamabad.

3. This study included six participants for data collection from colleges and universities. Although the sample was small, nevertheless it comprised a nice combination of teachers, professional development providers and designers to gain a variety of perspectives.

However, this study, in spite of its limitations, has generated important findings for any government education authorities, policy makers, college and university leadership, professional development providers and designers who seek to reform professional development practices for teachers of adults in Pakistan. To assist in such reforms, we make the following recommendations.

RECOMMENDATIONS DRAWN FROM THE STUDY

1. The role of government education authorities as policy makers is of great importance in establishing and promoting continuing professional development at college and university levels to improve teachers’ learning, classroom practice, and ultimately students’ learning.

Recommendation 1:
That government education authorities enact a uniform and coherent policy, and provide colleges and universities with dedicated fiscal support for teachers’ continuing professional development.
2. To continually learn and develop, the supportive, caring and nurturing role of school leadership is vital in creating active environments for teachers and communicating this culture of mutual growth within and among the schools.

**Recommendation 2:**
That teachers be provided with sufficient resources in the form of time, books, journals, computers, internet, funds, and other moral and intellectual support to stimulate their learning and development and to improve their practice.

3. Site-based provision of professional development implies active roles of teachers as main stakeholders in this endeavour. They need to demonstrate an increasing spirit of inquiry: open up their classrooms to others to share and learn and to better their thinking and practice with the help of others’ experiences. Characteristics, such as, communicating, cooperating, working together, discussing, reflecting, coaching, building, and consultation, are integral in forming and sustaining their communities of practice for their continuing development.

**Recommendation 3**
That teachers’ capacities to reflect critically upon their own teaching and its contexts, and their learning with their peers for mutual growth and development are facilitated in all forms of resourced professional development.

4. With respect to the model of professional development designed to present the results of this study, further research could be initiated to ascertain its effectiveness, value, proper function, implementation and the related qualities.
**Recommendation 4**

That a study in this area with a similar focus but a larger, country-wide group be conducted to see whether the same findings are presented. It may further be used to aid our understanding of what changes are further needed for the better functioning of this new vision in Pakistan. It would certainly require more time and resources than were available for the present research.

**THE END OF THE STORY**

At this stage, these initial findings are important for three reasons: a) these contribute towards filling up the knowledge gaps related to the Pakistani context and the practice; b) these open a debate and provide a strong foundation for further research on effective professional development; and c) introduce a new vision and provide a basic fabric and some structure for the suggested reforms to take place. This study would be fruitful in preparing initial ground work related to matters like their perceptions, roles, responsibilities, infrastructural needs, resources, implementation hurdles, networking needs and requirements, etc. Such data, along with the present study, will inform the policy makers to grasp the fuller picture of the matter and make preparations for its implementation.

The end of this story lies in its beginning. Pakistan, a land of bounties of nature and beautiful people, may be in trouble today, but has a lot to offer to its people and its neighbours tomorrow. To do so, we surely need more beginnings than endings today! Like many other areas, teachers are ‘at risk’ practitioners in Pakistan and they have a pressing need for a new beginning. They need sustained support and assistance in a new form of continuing professional development, to better their learning, classroom practices, and students’ learning. Any professional development that is unfocused, fragmented and unaligned with teachers’ needs, contexts, and student learning will remain ineffective. Therefore, policies should be amended to introduce school-based professional development, leadership should nurture stimulating environments for teachers to grow and develop, and the concerned authorities in Pakistan must ensure fiscal, human and
intellectual support without a compromise for sustainability. Beyond doubt, such investments can not only improve the quality of education, but also reform the whole education system. Certainly, it is thinkable, doable, and its results ineffable, so let's make a start!
REFERENCES


Erickson, F. (1986). Qualitative methods in research on teaching. In M. C.
Whittrock (Ed.), *Handbook of research on teaching*. New York: Macmillan.


APPENDICES

Appendix A: Information: Plain Language Statement 110
Appendix B: Participant Consent Form 111
Appendix C: Interview Questions 112
Appendix D: Sample of Interview Transcript 113
Appendix E: Sample of Data Reduction 114
Appendix F: Sample of Data Matrix Design 115
Appendix G: Sample of Data Analysis Notes 117
Appendix H: Designing of the Professional Development Model 118
Appendix I: Map of Pakistan of Pakistan and the Research Sites 119
Appendix A

Information: Plain Language Statement

Project Title: Designing for Better Pedagogy: A Tertiary/Higher Education Experience in Pakistan

You are invited to participate in the above research project, which is being conducted by Mr. Imran Anjum Chaudary and Mrs. Shahida Imran. Your name and contact details have been referred to us by one of your colleagues.

The aim of this project is to study whether the current professional development programmes provided to teachers of adults need to be improved, and if so, what are the key features of professional development design that could be suggested to improve knowledge, skills and dispositions of teachers in Tertiary/Higher education sectors in Pakistan. Should you agree to participate, you would be asked to participate in a 60 minute, one-on-one interview conducted by the researchers, so that we can get a more detailed picture of your professional experiences and thoughts in this regards. With your permission, the interview would be tape-recorded so that we can ensure that we make an accurate record of what you say. When the tape has been transcribed and responses translated into English, you would be provided with a copy of the transcript, so that you can verify that the information is correct and/or request deletions. We estimate that the time commitment required of you would not exceed 60 minutes.

We intend to protect your anonymity and the confidentiality of your responses to the fullest possible extent, within the limits of the law. Your name and contact details will be kept in a separate, password-protected computer file from any data that you supply. This will only be able to be linked to your responses by the researchers. In the final report, you will be referred to by a pseudonym. We will remove any references to personal information that might allow someone to guess your identity; however, you should note that as the number of people we seek to interview is very small, it is possible that someone may still be able to identify you.

Once the report arising from this research has been completed, a brief summary of the findings will be sent to you on your e-mail address. Your e-mail address obtained for this purpose shall be held separately from the research data. It is also possible that the results will be presented as a research article, a book or read at academic conferences. The data will be kept securely with the researchers for five years from the date of publication, before being destroyed.

Please be advised that your participation in this study is completely voluntary. Should you wish to withdraw at any stage, or to withdraw any unprocessed data you have supplied, you are free to do so without prejudice. If you would like to participate, please indicate that you have read and understood this information by signing the accompanying consent form and returning it to the researchers. The researchers will then arrange a mutually convenient time to meet for interview.

Should you require any further information, or have any concerns, please do not hesitate to contact either of the researchers: Mr. Imran Anjum Chaudary or Ms. Shahida Imran (0300-483-6133).
Appendix B
Participant Consent Form

Project Title: Designing for Better Pedagogy: A Tertiary/Higher Education Experience in Pakistan

Name of participant:

Name of investigators: Mr Imran Anjum Chaudary and Ms Shahida Imran

1. I consent to participate in this project, the details of which have been explained to me, and I have been provided with a written plain language statement to keep.

2. I understand that my participation will involve an interview and I agree that the researchers may use the results as described in the plain language statement.

3. I acknowledge that:
   - the possible effects of participating in the interview have been explained to my satisfaction;
   - I have been informed that I am free to withdraw from the project at any time without explanation or prejudice and to withdraw any unprocessed data I have provided;
   - the project is for the purpose of research;
   - I have been informed that the confidentiality of the information I provide will be safeguarded subject to any legal requirements;
   - I have been informed that with my consent the interview will be audio-taped and I understand that audio-tapes will be stored with the researchers and will be destroyed after five years;
   - my name will be referred to by a pseudonym in any publications arising from the research;
   - I have been informed that a copy of the research findings will be forwarded to me, should I agree to this.

I consent to this interview being audio-taped yes no (please tick)

I wish to receive a copy of the summary project report on research findings on the e-mail address provided below yes no (please tick)

Signature (Participant) ___________________ Date __________________

E-mail address: ________________________________
Appendix C
Interview Questions (focus)

1. Teacher/teacher educator/designer challenges.
2. Frequency of professional development opportunities.
3. Purpose of attending professional development.
4. Past experience of professional development programme.
5. Focus of current professional development.
6. Characteristics of effective professional development.
7. Access to good PD programmes in the context
8. During a professional development programme, think about these situations:
   - Teachers sit and only attend to a teacher educator talking about effective teaching skills.
   - Professional colleagues work together and develop each other's teaching skills.
   - Teachers, individually or with a teacher educator, learn by doing and by reflecting about their teaching?
9. Aim of professional development (comment):
   - theoretical knowledge and ideas,
   - teaching activities,
   - ability to decide about teaching and learning strategies?
10. Please reflect on the fundamental aim of professional development: should it be to provide a means of transmitting knowledge or facilitate teachers to transform and better their practices or something else?
11. Final comments.
Appendix D
Sample of Transcription of Audiotaped Record of Interview
Respondent: Sairan

Interviewer: As a teacher, what challenges do you face in your teaching in adult education classroom?
Sairan: I think we have more problems than solutions in adult education in Pakistan. There are number of problems to be honest. I think one very important problem is the classroom - the mixed ability and large classes. And then I think students’ expectations and teachers’ expectations. There is a conflict of interests. Students expect to be spoon-fed. They want the answers because of the system that we have. And teachers actually want some responsibility to be shared by their students - so there are many problems. Because your research is all about professional development, I think there are very few opportunities for professional development for me in response to my challenges. There are challenges of mixed ability classes, of content being changed quite frequently now. But I think there are not enough opportunities to develop as teachers.

Interviewer: How you and other teachers tackle these problems, then?
Sairan: I think we have been struggling. There is no systematic help or facility provided to teachers of adults. At school level, it is expected that teachers would be lacking in certain skills and there is innovation and there is research going on. Also, it is connected to funding in Pakistan. It’s not a home ground thing, you see. It is some external agency e.g. UN development Fund or Asian Development Fund would offer some money to certain agencies or certain government organization – then we would have a burst of this activity and there would be a couple of workshops or in-service training and then that would be it. But at college or university level, it is expected that because teachers have done their masters, therefore, they do not need any training or professional development. They are not offered any formal or informal professional development. It is only through trial and error method that we develop. And in smaller cities challenges are much bigger. And especially they don’t have communication skills.

Interviewer: In your institute, how often are teachers engaged or like to be engaged in PD? And, what level of engagement do they like to have?
Sairan: I think teachers are quite keen to go for professional development as far as I understand. As I am working at a degree college, which is a state-run
Appendix E
Sample of Data Reduction

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Archival No. and Deidentification</th>
<th>Participant Type</th>
<th>Interviewer</th>
<th>Transcriber</th>
<th>Translator</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LHT11-AH; Sairan</td>
<td>Teacher of adults</td>
<td>Imran A C</td>
<td>Shahida Imran</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Typist</td>
<td>Date/Time/Length/Place of interview</td>
<td>Date of transcription</td>
<td>Language of interview</td>
<td>Member checking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imran A C</td>
<td>23/08/11; 07:30 PM; 46 min; AEO</td>
<td>24/08/11</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>yes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Question 1: As a teacher, what challenges do you face in your teaching in adult education classroom?
- The mixed ability and large classes (Saira-1).
- Students expect to be spoon fed. They want the answers because of the system that we have (Saira-1).
- … of content being changed quite frequently now (Saira-1).
- There is no systematic help or facility provided to teachers of adults (Saira-1).
- In smaller cities challenges are much bigger (Saira-1).

Question 2: In your institute, how often are teachers engaged or like to be engaged in PD? And, what level of engagement do they like to have?
- At present, there is no support from the infrastructure or the institutions (Sairan-2).
- If there are, they are very brief - one of kind of workshops or seminars (Sairan-2).
- There is no culture of helping and sharing (Sairan-2).
- I think opportunities are not for everyone – not equal opportunities (Sairan-2).
- I think teachers are quite keen to go for professional development as far as I understand, especially young teachers. (Sairan-2)
- At college level, it is expected because teachers have done their masters, therefore, they do not need any training or professional development. It is only through trial and error method that we develop (Sairan-1).
- For the last thirty years nobody has ever asked me if I needed any kind of professional support or help (Sairan-7)

Question 3: What do you consider to be the purpose of attending professional development programs?
- To discuss their weaknesses with somebody (Sairan-3).
- Have more skills, have more knowledge, have more strategies to deal with difficult situations, [and] share these things (Sairan-3).
## Appendix F

Sample of Data Matrix Design

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Score</th>
<th>Design</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Study 1</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>Data Matrix Design 1</td>
<td>This is a brief description of the study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 2</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>Data Matrix Design 2</td>
<td>This is a brief description of the study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 3</td>
<td>88</td>
<td>Data Matrix Design 3</td>
<td>This is a brief description of the study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 4</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>Data Matrix Design 4</td>
<td>This is a brief description of the study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study 5</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>Data Matrix Design 5</td>
<td>This is a brief description of the study.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Legend:
- **Name**: Name of the study.
- **Score**: Score of the data matrix design.
- **Design**: Description of the data matrix design.
- **Notes**: Further notes or specific details about the study.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sairan</th>
<th>Khushi</th>
<th>Bilal</th>
<th>Surriah</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Q.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Q.11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix G

Sample of Data Analysis Not

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sections</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Categories</th>
<th>Emerging Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Section 1 | Q1. Challenges  
Q2. Frequency (How often)  
Q7. Problems in accessing PD | Passive learners-A  
Unsupported-A  
Inadequate-A  
Inequitable-A  
Lack of self-access material-B  
Absence of leadership-B | A-Persistent critique on the present situation  
B-Site Based |
| Section 2 | Q5. Focus on needs & build on experiences  
Q4. Dislike/Likes | Unrelated-A  
Not involved-A  
Information based-A  
Like engagement-C | C-Social Learning |
| Section 3 | Q3. PD purpose  
Q10. Aim of PD | Generic teaching skills-D  
Self-direction-D  
Linked with change in teachers’ practice-D  
Linked with change in students’ learning-E | D-Discipline-specific/Generic teaching skills formation  
E-Evaluation |
| Section 4 | Q6. Characteristics | Local control-B  
Collaborative and experiential-C-D  
Evaluation-E | |
| Section 5 | Q8. Three scenarios | Reflective and experiential-D  
Rejection of Top-Down Transmission of Information-D | |
| Section 6 | Q9. Theory/activities/decisionality | Holistic learning-D | |
| Section 7 | Q11. Final comments | Teachers as main stakeholders-A  
Coherent policy-A | |
Appendix H
Designing of the Professional Development Model

1. A model is being conceived using the results of this study.

2. Various characters of the model are brought together.

3. The model is taking its final shape.
Appendix I
Map of Pakistan and the Research Sites1 (in rectangles)

1 Lahore, Gujranwala, and Islamabad